THE MAJOR RELATION BETWEEN WESTERN METAPHYSICS AND SUFI LITERATURE

Dolat Khan

ABSTRACT

In the encounters between the Eastern and Western thought and literature, there are some historical moments when one can see both east and West coming closer. For instant, the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries when the Western powers' colonial enterprises in Eastern countries like India, Persia and the Middle East established a strong relation between both cultures but before discussing the colonial encounter between the east and West which was more of a political and cultural nature, we need to look at the close association of Eastern and Western thought in the Medieval period for a greater understanding of their philosophical and intellectual encounter. One can find two ways of thinking within Western philosophical development. One way is towards rational thinking, which is manifested in scientific discoveries from Copernicus in the late Medieval period to the evolutionary naturalism of Darwin in the nineteenth century. It also includes the metaphysical rationalization of Enlightenment thinkers like Hume, Voltaire and that of the later analytical thinkers of the late nineteenth to early twentieth century. The other way of thinking within this later productive period of critical thought in human history is Romantic idealism and the wonder-struck metaphysical wandering of German and English Romantic poets and philosophers alike. Coleridge's imaginative poetic thought shows that there always been a window corner away from the cold air of rational intellectualism and conventional dogmatism. People like Dante, Goethe, Coleridge and other Romantics and even Chaucer and his early English poetry have occupied this corner. The question this paper seeks to answer is that to what extent eastern and western major interactions have influenced the western literature and metaphysics.

Introduction

Modern philosophical and literary thoughts have their sources in the Middle Ages. To understand the landscape of Medieval thought and the sources under discussion one must look into the newly developing interest in Medieval thought and its contribution to later European philosophy and literature. Not so long ago, as Anthony Kenny observes, "courses in the history of philosophy went straight from Aristotle to Descartes" ignoring the fact that something worthwhile might have happened during late antiquity and the Middle Ages. One can find such prejudiced views in recent writings as Julian Young in his recent history of Western thought says, "From about the fourth to the eighteenth-century Western thinking was Christian thinking. This meant that throughout this period the question of the meaning of life was a non-issue; a non-issue because the answer was obvious, self-evident, the topic completely sewn up by Christianity's version of Platonism."[1] The writer may be right in his main contention of a similar worldview throughout Medieval Europe, however, this swift rejection of everything Medieval and the leap from Aristotle to Cartesian philosophy leaves us with many missing links in the history of metaphysics as a whole. Most importantly, without understanding Medieval developments in the history of metaphysics it is difficult to discern the links between Eastern and Western thought. Part of the emphasis of this research on Medieval thought is the important cross-pollination of metaphysical positions taken by Eastern Muslim and Western Christian theologians and mystics and the influence on both of already existing metaphysical orders of late antiquity and the early Middle Ages. This research also hopes to establish the roots of modern Romantic movements in the West and to explore the importance of contemporary metaphysical positions in literature and philosophy in the light of foundational Medieval thinking.

For the last two decades steady progress has been made in producing research work on Medieval thought. Most of these researchers point toward the Neoplatonist cosmology of Greek late antiquity as one of the most important factors and common sources for metaphysical speculation for both Western Christian thinkers and Eastern Muslim scholars of the Middle and later Middle Ages.

Researchers such as Anthony Kenny (2005) in his study of Medieval philosophy and Kreisel[2] and others in their study of Jewish thought in the Middle Ages emphasise the influence of Neoplatonism on all the important Christian, Muslim and Jewish thinkers. Early Christian thinkers like Augustine and Boethius are also the early source of Greek thoughts in later Christian theology. Augustine's *City of God* shows his profound knowledge of the pagan metaphysics of his age which he considered a real threat. *City of God* was written in defence of Christian faith against pagan thought but as Kenny observes, the work is imbued with a metaphysical version of Neoplatonism. Boethius ended up in prison for his pagan thoughts in *On the Consolation of Philosophy*. This is considered the last serious work in the philosophical traditions of classical Greece in the Christian West.[3]

From Boethius in the fifth century to the ninth century A. D the Western world did not see any real contributor to this metaphysical tradition. However, the same period saw a surge of Greek philosophy in the Muslim world. As Kenny notes, between the fifth and ninth centuries A. D. 'outside the Roman Empire the world was transformed beyond recognition'.[4] Referring to this era Thomas Robinson (in his introduction to a new course on the study of Oriental literature in Cambridge University in May 1838) grudgingly informs his students that, "For while the night of ignorance was fast closing over the entire Christian world, the Providence of God provided for human learning a sanctuary and a home, even among the blasphemers of truth and poured the treasures of the Greek philosophy into new and fresher channels…the elements of our present greatness in human science were nourished in the cradle of the East."[5] In the same introductory lecture, Robinson quotes Persian Sufi poet Khakani and call his work the 'finest art of Sufism'.

According to Kreisel, the Neoplatonic world view was very important to Medieval Islamic and Jewish thinkers such as al-Farabi and Moses Maimonides and these ideas saw a revival during the Renaissance period because of the availability and translation of Greek and Arabic Neoplatonic texts. Moreover, in the religious and philosophical works of this period one can find a battle between all sorts of ideas from Greek philosophy to Zoroastrianism. In between there is a range of metaphysical systems which fight for their supremacy alongside Neoplatonism. These include Gnosticism, Hermetism, Manicheanism, pagan fragments of Chaldean Oracles and Hellenistic deities and other syncretistic world views.

Similarly, R. Baine Harris talks about Muslim philosophical theologians like al-Kindi, Avicenna and Averroes and their use of

Neoplatonism in their interpretation of Islamic metaphysics. According to Harris, such interpretations were not only significant for the development of Islamic theology "but also for the impact they had upon the thought of certain major Jewish and Christian Medieval philosophers"[6] The significance of Neoplatonism and the availability of its texts in Arabic and their impact not only on Muslim and Christian but also on Jewish scholars of the Medieval period is acknowledged by many. Scholem thinks that the Medieval Jewish theologian and philosopher Maimonides had read the Neoplatonic text of 'Theology of Aristotle', which was an Arabic translation of later Greek philosophy widely available during the Middle Ages.

According to Scholem, Maimonides' inclination toward mysticism shows he was aware of Neoplatonic metaphysics.[7] Another researcher Idel contends that, " another source of motifs, concepts, and terms […] to Jewish Medieval mysticism was Neo-Platonism […] the deep religious significance of this form of philosophy has already been recognized in the cases of Islamic and Christian mysticism, and Kabbalah fully shares with these mystical systems a deep interest in Neo-Platonism."[8] There seems to be an intriguing web of cross connections between the three major religions and other existing syncretic metaphysics. In addition to the major philosophical impact of Neoplatonism, there were many other such systems existing side by side with Abrahamic religions such as alchemical hermetic beliefs and Gnosticism that are still with us in some shape or other. The existence and influence of such ideas can be judged by the reaction of the organised religions to the followers of different alchemical traditions. The history of Inquisitions and witch-hunts in the Christian world is a terrible example of persecution and torture against dissent and rival thinking in the Medieval period but it indicates the powerful influence of Medieval hermetic traditions that terrified the Church. Early Sufis and dervishes met a similar fate in the Islamic world. Here was the beginning of the division between orthodox religion and Sufi metaphysics, between organized religion and esoteric tradition.

Among all these battling ideas, Neoplatonism is highly influential with regard to emerging Christian and Islamic religious and mystical traditions of Medieval times as well as to the modern Romantics, Idealists and Transcendentalists of the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. As noted by the-twentieth century philosopher Albert Camus in his study of Christian metaphysics and Neoplatonism, Neoplatonism's aspiration of 'mystical longing for God' was compatible with Christian theology.[9] Camus finds in Neoplatonism

and in other later Greek metaphysics a concern for the 'destiny of soul' and 'an abiding need for rationality' and an idea of an enduring order. This search for intelligibility and coherence which Camus identifies in the thought of late antiquity usefully informed both Christian and Islamic theology.

In the eighth and ninth centuries A. D., Abbasid Caliphs made their capital Bagdad a centre of learning and cultural activities. Abbasid Caliph Haroon al-Rasheed established a learning centre called the 'House of Wisdom' headed by a learned Christian Scholar. The work of the scholars in this centre of learning was to translate all the previous knowledge into Arabic with their commentaries. During this time, Muslims learned Greek philosophy, science, and languages; they learned knowledge and art from everywhere, from the Chinese technique of paper making to Indian number system and architecture of Greeks and Indians.[10]

The Medieval Islamic world seems more vibrant and adoptive of everything Greek than the Western world of the Christian Church. Discussing the popularity of Greek philosophy among Muslims P. Morewedge says very significantly, "For Muslims, Plato, Aristotle, and Plotinus are part of the Islamic tradition in the same manner that Abraham is regarded to be a prophet of Islam."[11] As far as contemporary Muslims are concerned, it seems an overstatement, but for Medieval Muslims it seems to be the case without any doubt. There are many reasons for the profound effect of later Greek philosophies on Islamic traditions and its scholarship.

Many scholars, such as Harris and Kenny, talk about encounters between Neoplatonism and Islam on different occasions and many historians have noted the presence of Greek scholars in Persian court prior to the rise of Islam. Morewedge thinks that the availability of Platonists' writings in Arabic was due to "the Hellenistic scholars having taken refuge in Persian courts after Justinian closed the then Neoplatonic Platonic Academy of Athens in 529."[12] Kenny tells a similar story about how the scholarship of late Antiquity and other Greek philosophy ended up in the hands of Muslim enthusiasts of learning. According to Kenny, enlightened fourth century Syrian Christians founded a School of Greek learning in Edessa Mesopotamia. These Christian scholars did not accept the Condemnation of Nestorius at the Council of Ephesus in 431 AD – The First Council of Ephesus in modern day Turkey held in 431 to condemn as heretical the doctrine, which was informed by Nestorius's studies under Theodore of Mopsuestia at the School of Antioch, emphasises the disunion between the human and divine

natures of Jesus. Nestorius' teachings brought him into conflict with some other prominent church leaders, most notably Cyril of Alexandria, who criticized especially his rejection of the title Theotokos ("Bringer forth of God") for the Virgin Mary. Afterward many of Nestorius' supporters relocated to Sassanid Persia, where they affiliated with the local Christian community, known as the Church of the East. In punishment Emperor Zeno closed their school in 489 AD. These Christian Greek scholars went to Persia where they established their school and after the Muslim conquest, Greek scholars from this school were invited to the court of enlightened Caliphs in Baghad, where they translated most of the Greek works into Arabic. This learned activity generated a cultural renaissance well before the European renaissance.

Around this time, in the early ninth century Al-Kindi was the first Muslim philosopher who introduced Greek and Neoplatonic themes in Islamic theology and metaphysics. Al-Kindi introduced Kalam or logical reasoning into Islamic thought and his book called 'The Art of Dispelling Sorrows' according to many including Kenny and Jonathan Lyon bears resemblance to Boethius's 'Consolation'. He suggested many Neoplatonic themes in his philosophy such as the concepts of 'One, Mind and Soul', which were taken up by later Islamic philosophers of tenth and eleventh centuries including Al-Farabi and Avicenna. Al-Farabi very famously introduced the Neoplatonic concept of Emanation: that contends that every being in existence is emanated from a single source. In the tenth century Al-Farabi considers God as the prime mover like Plato but he has a more mystical bent of mind. He says, "the task of humans was to seek enlightenment from God and return to him from whom we originally emanated."[13]

In orthodox belief God is an outsider ordering the world to be 'kun-faya-qun' and there it is, made by a creator not part of the world. The orthodox God is more of an impersonal ruler than a friend and beloved as we can see in the Sufi tradition. This concept of Emanation and the 'One' found in later Neoplatonists' writing is very close to the Sufi understanding of God and Truth. According to Kenny, Proclus the head of Athens Plotinus School in his *Elements of Theology* talks about three level of beings 'Soul', 'Mind' and "One'. "As united to our animal body, the human soul expresses itself in Eros, focused on earthly beauty. But it has also an imperishable ethereal body made out of light. Thus, it passes beyond love of beauty in search of Truth, a pursuit that brings it into contact with the ideal realities of the world of Mind. But it has a faculty higher

than that of thought, that brings it, by mystical ecstasy, into Union with the One."[14] The Sufi 'path' is conceptually quite similar except that Sufi traditions have more than three stages. This notion then became the basis of Sufi traditions. This idea is known to Sufi world as 'wahdath ul wajood' i. e. oneness of beings. These concepts were destined to become a new and unorthodox face of Islamic faith, which Great Sufi theorists like Ibn Arabi and Sufi poets like Rumi, Khayyam and others built upon and popularized in their mesmerizing poetic works.

Another Persian Muslim philosopher Avicenna followed in the footsteps of al-Kindi and Al-Farabi in his commentaries on Aristotle's work and his Neoplatonic texts made a distinction between essence and existence which according to Lyon and Kenny "occupied a central role in all succeeding metaphysics."[15] Many writers think that his system is fundamentally Neoplatonic and makes no special appeal to the authority of the Quran. His theory that "in all creatures Essence and Existence are distinct but in God 'Essence entails existence' and world emanates from God"[16] is of paramount importance to Sufi doctrine. His speculations on Greek thought triggered the imagination of the Christian West, which is manifested in the works of Thomas Aquinas. Aquinas addresses this question in his 'Essence and Being. ' In agreement with Avicenna, he writes, "Avicenna says…that the quiddity of a composite substance is the very composition of the form and the matter…Moreover, reason supports this view, for the existence of a composite substance is neither form alone nor matter but composed of these."[17] This remained a valid philosophical question in the West from Cartesian to Existential traditions.

The idea that a revival of Greek ideas became possible only during the European Renaissance of the late Middle Ages is far from the truth. First of all, Greek philosophy and science did not disappear with the decline of Greek power and civilization as a political and military force. Greek learning centres continued to exist well into the Christian era; Neoplatonist Schools in Athens and Alexandria were functional and full of great philosophical minds until the fifth century when Justinian closed the Athens School. Another Greek School was established by Syrian Christian scholars but was later closed by Emperor Zeno. All these learned activities involving Greek knowledge happened in Eastern provinces of the Christian Latin Empire and the scholars in these schools did not fade away when Christian Emperors closed the schools in fifth and sixth centuries but as many writers have noted they migrated to Persian

courts and continued their work. One must remember that these Eastern Christian provinces of Syria, Egypt and others and also the Persian court where Greek learning and particularly Neoplatonic Schools continued to exist were soon to become the centres of Islamic power. Will Durant in his *Oriental Heritage* says that among the greatest achievements of the Persian empire Sassanid dynasty (A. D 224 to A. D 651) was the translation of Greek works into Persian. Arabs subsequently inherited this knowledge and the cultural traditions of Persia. Muslim scholars took these ideas from Greek and Christian Scholars who were already there in the Persian court and Eastern provinces of the Byzantine Empire and furthered their own theological and philosophical theories. So we can see continuity in Greek learning and philosophy and this continues throughout the Middle Ages. Renaissance Scholars and artisans simply inherited what was there in the preceding centuries. The major Christian theologians and philosophers were aware of Greek ideas and tried to incorporate these in their writings, as we have seen in the case of Augustine and Boethius.

After the decline of the great Greek and Mediterranean powers of late antiquity, two important events were taking place on the horizon of the Latin and Persian world – the rise of Christianity and Islam. Although, Christian and Islamic faiths apparently rejected all previous knowledge except those of Abrahamic traditions as pagan superstition this is obviously not the case when one reads the Medieval theologians and philosophers of both Christian and Muslim origin. Despite the overwhelming influence of these metaphysical orders of late antiquity in furthering sophisticated interpretations of Medieval religious world views both in the east and West Mediterranean alike, the Christian Church and mainstream Islam have historically never deign to acknowledge the importance of those other metaphysical philosophies in their doctrines.

In addition to the continued existence of Greek learning in the Eastern part of Mediterranean; there is at least one Western European Christian thinker, the ninth century Eriugena, who demonstrated Greek learning in his theology in the early Middle Ages. As Kenny observes, "Though Eriugena constantly quotes the Bible, his system is closer to pagan Neoplatonism than to traditional Christian thought."[18] However, many scholars agree that Eriugena is a less important figure in the development of Western Medieval philosophy than people like Avicenna and Averroes from the east. Unlike Avicenna, Averroes (or Ibn-Rushd) was closer to the West and to the spirit of Renaissance Europe both mentally and physically.

He was born and lived in Europe in the south of Spain during the twelfth century and he abandoned Avicenna's Neo-Platonist ideals of 'Soul', 'Mind' and 'One'; in their place he adopted a more rational approach closer to the original Aristotelian reason than the Neoplatonist's mystification of existence. He believed in a cosmos where cause and effect has its role to play. He was unorthodox in a different sense, a precursor of later European enlightenment and rationalist cosmology. What is important with regard to Averroes however is his physical closeness to Europe.

Muslim Spain and Sicily represent the physical arrival of the Eastern Mediterranean mind into the Western part in the early Middle Ages and this presence flourishes in Europe for centuries. The existence of Muslim Spain within the European mainland brought Eastern romances and Eastern myths closer to the Western mind. H. A. R. Gibb talks about the essential romantic spirit in Eastern literature and thinks that the *Provencal* poetry of southern France in the eleventh century was very close in themes and imagery to the already established poetic traditions of Muslim Spain of that time. Thomas Arnold and others also insist on the importance of Muslim Spain and Sicily's profound influence on the art and literature of Medieval Europe.

Gibb, while talking about the richly imagistic portrayal of unattainable mistresses and fantasy in Persian poetry concludes, "This type of love-lyric was destined to play a part in the history of European literature."[19] Trade links established during this time by the merchants of Spain and Sicily with Eastern Muslim lands open up a window through which Western merchants not only brought Eastern goods but also Eastern stories and literature in the West. Many of these Eastern tales ended up in Western literary canons such as *The Decameron*, *The Divine Comedy* and *The Canterbury Tales*. Gibb records the way many Arabic and Persian moral stories filter into Medieval Europe, among these are Kalila and Dimna, translated into Spanish in the thirteenth century.

Many believe that the story of the Prophet Muhammad's (PBUH) ascent and journey in the heaven has some influence on the development of *The Divine Comedy*. Gibb thinks that "eroticism of the Muslim mystics are certainly reflected in Dante's work."[20] Gibb makes similar observations regarding Boccaccio's Decameron and Chaucer's Squieres Tale, he notes, "It was from oral sources, in all probability, that Boccaccio derived the oriental tales which he inserted in the Decamerone […] Chaucer's Squieres Tale is an Arabian Nights' story, which was probably brought to Europe by

Italian merchants from the Black Sea, since the scene is laid at the court of the Mongol Khan on the Volga."[21] Robert Irwin also thinks that themes and motifs with parallels in the Arabian Nights are found in Chaucer's *The Canterbury Tales*, "In the Squire's Tale the hero travels on a flying brass horse. " The use of magical stories, dream visions and the creation of romantic imagery world in the works of Boccaccio, Dante and Chaucer certainly show some Eastern parallels which most probably travel through Spain and Sicily's Muslim culture into Western literature and language.

The modern relations the Western world established between of the east established during colonial phase the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries became less intellectual and metaphysical in the many respects and more political and cultural. Because of the advancement of Western intellectual prowess after the Renaissance in the meantime the Eastern world, especially the Muslim world, did not experience any such period of intellectual growth. Having said that, as we can see in the following discussion the Romantics in Europe and the Transcendentalists in America did pick up some of the Medieval metaphysical themes or as often regarded as spirituality found in the Medieval Persian Sufi literature which have become part of the Western consciousness ever sense.

The continued charm of Eastern mysteries and literature on the mind of Western writers took a new turn during the rise of Western political and economic supremacy in the colonial period of the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. The encounter of Western orientalists with Eastern culture and literature post-Renaissance and during colonialism refreshed the persisting Medieval links between both cultures. Edward Said may accuse Western orientalists of bigotry and stereotyping towards the colonised east but there is ample evidence that on many occasions orientalists rediscovered their own roots in the east. William Jones is a good example of an orientalist scholar rediscovering the Aryan roots of the European people and their languages in the ancient east. It is not always a question of the colonized other being negatively portrayed by the orientalist, as Said suggests.

The romantic idealisation of the east is one of many sources for new perspectives in Western literature and philosophy after the Enlightenment, which in turn led to European Romanticism and the decline of classical mannerism in the West. However, one cannot suggest that the Romantic impulse that took Europe by storm in the eighteenth century was essentially rooted in the east because, as it has been argued in the preceding paragraphs both Eastern and Western

Mediterranean cultures of the Middle Ages share a mysterious longing that originates in the later ideas of Greek antiquity. However, the rediscovery of oriental culture in colonial encounters surely enhanced the Romantic urge for spontaneity and the pursuit of the unknown. The Medieval fellowship between the Eastern Muslim and Western Christian world was lost to some extent during the heyday of European Renaissance and Enlightenment movements but oriental studies during the colonial period enabled European writers to approach the east and particularly the Muslim world with a new perspective. Mentioning writers of Western origin with an interest in Eastern culture and literature during the colonial period does not necessarily mean all orientalists have a colonial approach towards the east like their compatriots and a political and economic agenda as most of post-colonial polemic suggests. For example, the translation and reception of Middle Eastern romances such as *The Arabian Nights* during the early eighteenth century in France and later in every European language seems more like a question of literary taste than political agenda. The same thing can be said about serious German scholarship on Eastern literature. However, it is not remit of this discussion to address the post-colonial theory of orientalism. The important thing to note here is the reception of Eastern literature in eighteenth and nineteenth century Europe.

This was a very conducive time for oriental literature and its mysteries to arrive in Europe, first through the British orientalists and then through adoption by Germany with enthusiasm and seriousness. During the Age of Enlightenment very successful British enterprises in the East brought the curious intellectuals of Europe face to face with its riches. The bulk of Arabic and Persian literature and thought coming into Europe made it necessary for the great learning centres like Oxford and Cambridge to offer courses of Arabic and Persian literature in these and other European universities. This shows the extent of reception of these literatures in European society.

William Jones established the Asia Society of Bengal in 1784 which produced groundbreaking works on Eastern literature and languages. Jones was an accomplished Persian and Arabic scholar and wrote a famous Persian grammar. He was a philologist and the founder of the map of Indo-European family of languages, the theory which established the idea of a proto-Indo-European language as the common ancestor for most of the languages spoken in modern day Europe, India and Iran. Although, he was more interested in Eastern languages his translations of Sufi texts were

equally important in opening up a new world of literary and metaphysical sensibility to the nascent Romantic poets. As noted by Jerome J. McGann 'Jones's philological writings on Persian and Arabic materials along with his pseudo-translations of Vedic hymns were a major source of the romantic orientalism that flooded across the period. 'McGann also credits Jone's poetic translations of Eastern literature as singular and distinctive features of the age with "its tendency to break with or to seek places beyond centralized and traditional cultural authorities."[22]

McGann very curiously puts Jones's translation of a Hindu hymn as the first poem of his anthology of Romantic verse because he considers Jones's work as the source of early nineteenth century Romanticism. As he notes, 'Jones's translations also locate romanticism's roots in the late eighteenth century's many philologized and anthropological projects. 'The important thing to note here is that it is not only the nature of the verse that Jones's translations were set to transform which is also true and rightly emphasised by McGann in his introduction to the anthology, but that the nature and the ontological position contained in these Eastern literary forms would also have great significance for later Romantic literature as well. Jones himself identifies the metaphysical quests contained in the poems he was translating from Persian and Sanskrit, and noted in his introduction to the same Hindu hymn that McGann includes in his anthology, 'A complete introduction to the following Ode would be no less than a full comment on the VAYDS and PURA'NS of the Hindus, the remains of Egyptian and Persian Theology.[23] In the same introduction he mentions the ancient wisdom in these Eastern literary works, he described the ancient wisdom as the idea that "The whole creation was rather an energy than a work, by which the Infinite Being […] exhibits to the minds of his creatures […] like a wonderful picture or piece of musick, always varied, yet always uniform […] but exist only as far they are perceived."[24]

The East India Company founded a college at Hertford where Persian was taught along with other Eastern languages. Because of these efforts, Arberry notes, it was generally known in India that Englishmen in India were known to be fluent not only in Persian but in Persian literature as well. They, "learnt to dispute learnedly in Persian and to quote Hafiz as they would Horace."[25] Because of this enthusiasm for learning Persian literature and language, British orientalists led the civilized world for decades in Islamic Scholarship. A much more meaningful and scholarly relationship between Eastern

literatures and English was established during this period; the first Governor General of India Warren Hastings encouraged British officers and academics in India to learn local languages and literature. He supported Jone's efforts to establish a Bengal Asiatic Society and he earlier founded a university in Calcutta in 1781. According to Arberry, Hastings was 'able to quote the Persian poets'. He encouraged and supported people like Francis Gladwin and Sir John Malcolm who contributed a great deal in Persian studies. Gladwin's Persian Moonshee, which consisted of Persian grammar and some poetry and stories of Saadi and Attar, was taught in Fort William College. He also translated Shaikh Sa'adi's *The Pundnameh* in 1788 and *The Gulistan* in 1806. Malcolm, known to have 'learned and loved Persian' wrote a *History of Persia* in 1815 and also published *Sketches of Persia* in 1827. He was an accomplished Persian scholar. Moreover, Cambridge Sanskritist E. B. Cowell, who taught Persian to Fitzgerald, translated Salaman and Absal of Jami and parts of Attar's *Allegory of the Birds* which introduced these great Sufi masters to the enthusiastic readers of English literature.[26] However, it was not until the second half of nineteenth century when Sufi poetry truly became an integrated part of English literature. Fitzgerald's celebrated translation of the *Rubaiyat of Omar Khayyam* in 1859, Gertrude Bell's accomplished translation of Hafiz as *Sweet Singer of Shiraz* and a versified translation of Rumi's poetry by Whinfield in 1887 made the Sufi Persian poetry a part of British consciousness ever since. Ruskin after reading Fitzgerald's *Rubaiyat of Omar Khayyam* said he "never did-till this day-read, anything so glorious.[27]" American transcendentalist Emerson read and admired Fitzgerald's translation. Lawrence mentions Fitzgerald's translation in his novel *Sons and Lovers* where Paul gives a copy of *Rubaiyat* to his sweet heart Mariam. Many notable English writers quoted or read Whinfield's translation of Rumi including poet Ezra Pound and philosopher Bertrand Russell in his *Metaphysics*. Like English scholarship of Sufi literature, German Romantic philosophers were also aware of Sufi thought rather in a much more profound way than many other European literature and philosophy of the time.

It is hard to say how much Romantic poets such as William Wordsworth and others were aware of Sufi thought and literature available at the period after groundbreaking works of Jones's and others who followed him as noted above but given the availability of so many Sufi texts translated into English and also the evidence of Wordsworth reading of *The Arabian Nights* in the *Prelude*, one can guess of his familiarity of themes of the Sufi literature. In the *Prelude Book V,* for instance, Wordsworth describes his dream-like

apocalyptic vision in which he is frightened by the scenes of the world's destruction. In his vision he sees an Arab carrying a stone and shell. Ted Holt and John Gilroy in their *A Commentary on Wordsworth's Prelude* regard the stone as a symbol of geometry and the shell as a symbol of poetry and suggest that, "Wordsworth makes an effort to identify with him (Arab) as heroic book-saver. " Towards the end of the *Prelude Book V* while talking about the importance of romance and irrational literature in stabilizing his response to the 'horror', Wordsworth describes his love for romances such as *The Arabian Nights*. He tells the story of how he decided to 'hoard up' to buy 'four large volumes' of the 'Arabian Nights' tales. He and his friend save their pocket money to buy *The Arabian Nights* which provide a sense of wonder and delight to his mind, as commentators observe, " 'The little … slender abstract of the Arabian tales' is allowed to remain for the children a door half opening up unrealised delight."[28]

However, apart from the obvious references to the Eastern romances, Wordsworth's *Prelude* can be compared with a Sufi journey into the self. The poem opens with the peaceful liberating influence of the 'gentle breeze'. For Holt and Gilroy, the breeze is 'synonymous with freedom' because the breeze has no direction but most importantly, 'the poet feels sympathy with the breeze because it is as homeless and as liberated as himself. ' The sense of freedom and release from being homeless and directionless is a famous Sufi theme. Sufis are called dervish, which is synonymous with wanderer and also faqeer – somebody who is penniless and does not own any property. Sufis are proud of their poverty because wealth makes a slave of its owner. Wordsworth assigned this state to the city where he feels in 'prison' and 'bondage' from where the 'breeze' released him, "Now I am free, enfranchised and at large. "Wordsworth in his *Prelude* embarked on a spiritual journey which starts with his childhood memories – the river 'loved / To blend his murmurs with my nurse's song'. After the liberation he feels in the first few lines the poet plunged into an uncertainty about his mission. He tries to find his purpose in life around the 'external things' such as landscapes in 'Forms, images'. He confusedly weighs his options and tries to find meaning and sense of achievement his poetry by portraying nature, then he learns to 'yield' and abandon his determination to express his will – 'Spare to Speak' which brings him to a very important conclusion – the poet decides to write a philosophical poem of a spiritual journey of his mind. Metaphysically speaking the poet's search for meaning makes him look inside his

own self for purpose in his poetic imagination; in Rumi's word, "Why should I seek? / I am the same as He. / His essence speaks through me. / I have been looking for myself!"[29]

In another place Wordsworth talks like a Sufi, in the Prospectus to *The Recluse* he said of his purpose in writing poetry, "Of the individual mind that keeps its own / Inviolate retirement, and consists / with being limitless – the one great life." Similarly, in the *Prelude* Wordsworth explain to Coleridge that 'how the heart was framed / of him thou lovest' which reminds ones of Rumi's companionship with Shams Tabrizi and the concept of 'beloved' in Sufi literature. At the end of the second part of the *Prelude* Wordsworth described his perception of the Unity of Creation – "In all things / I saw one life, and felt that it was joy. " Similarly, the insistence of not only Sufi but Neoplatonic concepts as well in the work of European Romantic and post-Romantic writers reveals a tendency to look back to late Antiquity for the solution to their metaphysical anxieties. Bate counts the Neoplatonism of Plotinus and Jacob Boehme and the German philosophy of his own day as a major influence on Coleridge. Art for Coleridge like nature reconciles the universal with the particular through evolution and assimilation. For Coleridge, "The heart should have fed upon the truth, as insects on a leaf, till it be tinged with the color and show its food in every minutest fibre."[30] Warren thinks that Coleridge's concept of 'One Life' in which all creation participates is derived from his studies of Neoplatonism. The Evolution of mind in Wordsworth's *Prelude* can be taken as the spiritual journey that we see in Sufi traditions. Wordsworth's emphasis on spontaneity for the expression of pure feelings is a kind of ecstatic truth of Sufi consciousness. As Langbaum says, for Wordsworth "the poet is more spiritual than the rest of us because he remembers more than we do – though his remembering is often spoken of as a kind of forgetting: 'By such forgetfulness, the soul becomes, /Words cannot say how beautiful' (Recluse)."[31] For Blake also, 'poetic genius' is a mark of the 'True Man' which is the source of 'all religious and philosophical knowledge'. Blake says in a classical Sufi expression, that "He who sees the Infinite in all things, sees God. He, who sees The Ratio only, sees himself only. Therefore God becomes as we are, that we may be as he is."[32] Yohannan quotes Hegel's assessment of the Sufis' pantheistic approach in comparison to his own view of poetic symbols. Hegel says:

> When we speak in our poetry of Roses, Nightingales, and Wine, it is done in a […] prosaic sense; the Rose is regarded as for ornament; we

> are crowned with Roses, or we hear the Nightingale and we sympathise with it; we drink wine and call it the Dispeller of Care…with the Persian poets, however, the Rose is not an image, or a symbol, or a mere ornament, but it actually appears to the poet as animated with a Soul, as a loving Bride, and he penetrates with his Spirit deep into the soul of the Rose."[33]

Nevertheless, the Rose for the Romantics ceased to be a temporary image of beauty, Keats, for instant, calls the voice of the Nightingale as everlasting voice, which existed in times of ancient Greeks and will continue to exist after the death of the poet. To include some other roots taken by the Eastern scholarship reaching into the modern Western world, we need to limit our discussion on the understanding of Sufi themes in English Romantic poetry.

Sufi learning has long been part of academic and institutional traditions in England, for instant; chair of Arabic studies was established at Cambridge University in 1632 and in 1636 at Oxford University. Interestingly, many professors who hold the Arabic chair in Cambridge and Oxford had been distinguished Persian scholars such as Professor Edward Granville Browne held office during the first two decades of the nineteenth century was considered the greatest Persian scholar outside Iran. Professor Reynold Alleyne Nicholson who succeeded Professor Browne was the finest translator of the Sufi poetry of Rumi and others and also wrote a history of Sufism. Professor Arthur John Arberry who hold office during 1940s and 1950s is source of most of modern Sufi poetry in English.

In the introduction to his 1838 lecture course 'On the study of Oriental Literature' the Professor of Arabic at Cambridge University Thomas Robinson informs his students that "The helps for the attainment of the languages of the east have been so multiplied and improved of late years. " He advises students to borrow books from the university library and from his own collection "I possess a considerable number collected during my residence in India [. . .] either Arabic or Persian language."[34] He refers to the availability of a 'great mass' of Eastern literature in Europe that contains 'the best and purest sources of information or the finest models of composition. ' noting particularly 'the dark recesses of Persian lore' in these works. He also acknowledges the accomplishments of Cambridge academics Ockley and Carlyle in oriental knowledge and dissemination of oriental scholarship and he advises his students of the achievements in this field in other universities in Holland, France and Germany. He further refers to Rev. Charles Forster's

Mahometanism Unveiled where the theologian shows how largely 'Europe is at this moment indebted to that learning which was the result of the Saracenic conquests'.

Professor Gibb as mentioned above gave a different story of the Medieval Persian text's journey to the romantic poets, different from scholarly legacy of Jones and his Asiatic Society and also different from academic scholarship at Cambridge and Oxford university noted above. He links the Romantic spirit of Europe with the availability of Eastern tales and folklores in early eighteenth century Europe. He talks about Galland's translation of the *Arabian Nights* in 1704 into French, the Persian tales of *The Thousand and One Nights*, and the Turkish tale *Sindbad* and *The Vision of Mirza*. These tales were rich in colour, warm, exotic and mysterious, and triggered the European imagination. Referring to the tales Gibb notes, "In France, reverting, by a strange coincidence, to the truly oriental form of apologue, it furnished Voltaire and the reformers with a setting for their political and social satire." *The Arabian Nights* became so instantly popular that they were soon available in every European language and ran through many editions.

The Arabian Nights, originally called *One Thousand and One Nights,* have their origin in Persian and Middle Eastern folklore; the principal characters Shahryar and Sheherazade are of Persian origin, Aladdin's wonderful lamp and the Sindbad tales are Middle-Eastern folk tales, and some tales have their origin in Persian *Hazar Afsaneh* 'The Thousand Stories'. Irwin thinks that some of the stories came from India and Persia. The Nights was a favourite book of many British authors of the Romantic and Victorian eras. According to A. S. Byatt, "In British Romantic poetry the *Arabian Nights* stood for the wonderful against the mundane, the imaginative against the prosaically and reductively rational."[35] A Gothic novel Vathek has its origin in an Arabian tale about Abasi Caliph Vathek or Al-Wathiq of ninth century written by French writer William Beckford in 1782 and later translated into English by Samuel Henley in 1786 with a new title An Arabian Tale.

Many Romantic poets were inspired by this novel, Lord Byron mentioned Vathek as a source for his poem, The Giaour. In Childe Harold's Pilgrimage. According to Gemmet the poem's oriental setting inspired many Romantic works including Robert Southey's Thalaba the Destroyer, Thomas Moore's oriental romance Lalla-Rookh and John Keats's vision of the underworld in Endymion. Some of these works were phenomenally popular, Lalla-Rookh was adopted for many musical settings, and Byron's The Giaour and

other oriental poems including The Bride of Abydos, The Corsair and Lara became fashionable in a scale comparable to today's cinema. Although these tales and their admirers did not articulate a serious metaphysical position like Medieval Sufi traditions and Sufi poetry, the joyous appreciation and reception of the oriental tales in Europe's popular and emerging literary culture is significant for the debate about Arabic and Persian influence at this time.

However, whatever roots and tradition we prefer, it is certain that from William Jones's treatise on Asiatic Poetry to Goethe's deeply religious and metaphysical study of Hafiz and others, Persian Sufi poetry left a mark on the European Romantics and Idealistic traditions and thereby on much European thought and literature till today. Since the fine translations of Rumi's and Khayyam's poetry in nineteenth century, Persian Sufi literature has been a part of English and American literature in the same way as any other important English poetry with serious metaphysical vision. For example writing in 1930-1 Gibb says, "Omar Khayyam is a name more familiar in England and America than in Persia."[36]

British writers might have had more access to Eastern Sufi literature and their enterprises India and Persia certainly stimulated German orientalists, however, there are reason to believe that people like Goethe and other Romantic thinkers had direct access to Sufi and other Eastern literature as well. Although there were no German colonial enterprises during the Enlightenment period which would have triggered systemic studies of the Eastern languages and literature as did British scholars in India and Persia, Germany was not devoid of Eastern literature during seventeenth and eighteenth century. More original oriental works identified by Remy and others were available in Germany during the eighteenth century, such as Gottlob Meissner's tales of *Nushirvan*, *Massoud*, *Giaffar* and *Sadi* and most importantly Klinger's *Derwisch* and others like Tieck's *Abdullah* and Hauff's *Karawane*.

Moreover, one of the most celebrated poets of German literature Herder according to F. J. Arthur Remy and others wrote four books of translations of maxims from Saadi's *Gulistan* taken from Olearius's translations. Only one of his four books which mostly consists of Rumi's poetry is taken from Jones' *Poeseos*. Towards the end of eighteenth century German philosophy and literature was more than ready to receive Sufi thought and poetry along with other Eastern philosophy with appreciation. German Romantics as Hellerich observes, were nostalgic and opposed to the Enlightenment and were looking for 'fancy, dreams, disappearing, the unattainable and

the infinite. One of the early German Romantics Novalis's mystical outlook and belief in a new Christian faith shows a close parallel existed in late eighteenth century German metaphysics. His utterances about his beloved Sophie whom he lost soon after their engagement reveal a deeply metaphysical association like Sufi concept of love. He calls Sophie 'the highest' and 'the only thing', in many occasion he pronounces 'Christ and Sophie' as his religion. He says, "Love founded in faith [. . .] such love is religion."[37] According to Hellerich, Novalis along with other German Romantics repeatedly looked east in their work. It is because of their Romantic sensibility that the German Romantics were passionate about oriental mysteries and particularly the Persian rapture for transcendent beauty as manifested in the Sufi literature.

Returning to a point made earlier regarding the settings of the Catholic Church, which were decorated with highly imaginative paintings, and also the charm of singing and chorus during High Mass; such traditional romantic setting in the Roman Catholic churches fascinated Romantic thinkers. For example, Friedrich Schlegel an important Romantic thinker joined Roman Catholic Church, he was a great reader and admirer of oriental literature as well and wrote a book called *On the Language and Wisdom of India* in 1808. Schlegel says, "It is in the East that we have to look for the highest romanticism."[38] According to many of his biographers, he wanted to write a grammar for Persian language and for that purpose he studied Persian in the Bibliotheque Nationale in Paris but it is not certain that he was ever able to write his Persian grammar. That may be because his attention shifted towards Indian myths. In his works, he talks about 'religion of culture' and 'synthesising' Eastern and Western religious experience. He says, "Man is free whenever he produces or manifests God, and through this, he becomes immortal."[39] In a letter to Novalis in 1798 he expresses his vision of a new religion which requires him to write a 'new Bible and to walk in the footsteps of Muhammed and Luther'. His new religion has to be founded in literature and in tradition of Goethe as a new prophet. This vision of a strong connection between religion and literature and for that matter between philosophy and literature is significant while interpreting Sufi literature.

Andrew Bowie's study of early German Romantics literary theory and its philosophical implication is significant in this regard. Bowie regarded German Romantics as the real founders of literary theory, the aesthetic philosophy promoted by German and other Romantics emphasised on imagination and creativity. Unlike later formalists and

structuralists who promoted a linguistic approach towards art and literary criticism the early nineteenth century Romantics developed and embraced the philosophical notion of aesthetics. For Bowie, "Questions about poetry and literature are in fact inseparably connected to the history of Western philosophy."[40] The idea, as noted earlier, that art and literature in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth century as seen by Romantics to be a substitute for the disappearing religious sensibility make the rise 'philosophical aesthetics' absolutely understandable. Bowie rightly observed that, "Romantic enthusiasm for art has been understood as part of the attempts to fill gaps left by the process of secularization and rationalisation in Western societies."[41]

Brad Prager, on the other hand, associates the obscure visualization in the imaginative art of early German Romantic writers with the tradition of Kantian transcendental philosophy and other post-Kant Idealists such as Fichte. However, the religious sensibility as shown in the writings of Novalis and Schlegel suggests that the importance of oriental tales and Sufi concept of transcendent object of love are well established in the consciousness of German Romantics. Hellerich points toward the significance of Eastern religious and literary traditions in the writings of Schlegel, he says, the east "appealed to Schlegel not only because he had a brother who died there (India); his interest in oriental mythology, poetry, and religion also followed a general trend in Europe."[42]

Schlegel's brother August Schlegel, another German Romantic figure, underlines the importance of religious sensibility in literature as a metaphysical discourse, he says, 'Protestantism pursuing unsensuousness in the worship of God […] was not conducive to the success of religious poets.'[43] Such an unorthodox atmosphere in the literary and intellectual circles of early nineteenth century Germany was a natural place of welcome to Sufi literature of the Persian masters. This kind of literature had no place for a real appreciation in their own societies where the decline of Medieval Muslim scholarship was completed, which created a new wave of hardening Muslim orthodoxy. However, the European writers took on this literature of Persian Sufis enthusiastically essentially because of the tone, outlook and ontological position these poets take against authority and received conventionality. The richness of color, imagination and lore of rustic folk tales in these poetic masterpieces made them attractive to the Romantic mood of post-neoclassical literature.

A complete version of greatest Persian lyrical poet Hafiz in early eighteenth century by Austrian orientalist Joseph von Hammer provided the German Romantic poets with a real taste of Sufi literature. Although Hafiz's poetry does not have the metaphysical depth of his great predecessor and real Sufi master Rumi, his sheer poetic genius and charm and the musicality of his pure Persian Ghazal form intoxicated a generation of German Romantics and many more readers of eighteenth century European literature. Hafiz uses Sufi images and anecdotes in a lighter, much more bold and sophisticated lyrical tone in his poetry.

Von Hammer's translation captured the imagination of the greatest German writer Goethe. Goethe was interested in Hindu mythology in his early years as a student, according to Remy and read the Indian masterpiece *Kalidasa,* which is included in his Faust Prologue. Later influenced by von Hammer's translation of Hafiz he became himself a Persian poet in the sense that he wrote his own *divan,* inspired by *Divan-e-Hafiz*. The oriental and essentially Sufi images are employed all over the poem with such accuracy that the poem successfully creates, as Remy observes, 'a genuine oriental atmosphere'. However, what for Remy is an oriental atmosphere is in reality a Sufi world. There are too many oriental atmospheres to lump them together as many Western commentators conveniently do but the kind of oriental atmosphere Remy is talking about with regard to Goethe's *divan* is a particular orient which one cannot find in Hindu mythology or Japanese Haiku. It is only available in the Sufi literature of Persian origin, for instance, the images of 'saqi' or the 'glass bearer', the love of the nightingale for the rose, the allusions to the loves of Yusuf and Zulikha and of Laila and Majnun, to the moth and candle, etc.

These images, similes and metaphors are adopted in Sufi literature to explain certain metaphysical positions. Hafiz was not the creator of these images of love and association but he is following the Sufi tradition of the poetic diction and style of Attar, Rumi and Ibn Arabi. It is true as many critics have pointed out that Goethe did not take most of these Sufi concept from Hafiz's poetry in their true mystical context. However, he would have found Hafiz's liberating tone and ecstatic love lyrics convivial to the new Romantic mood of his age. As one of the greatest literary figures of eighteenth century Europe, he represents the susceptibility of European Romanticism and Idealism to the Sufi lore of the Medieval east. This discussion will return in the third chapter but this important aspect of Goethe's inclination towards alternative metaphysical realms can be seen in a

significant comment in his autobiography about his religious lessons at home. He says, "Church-Protestantism imparted to us was, properly speaking, nothing but a kind of dry morality: ingenious exposition was not thought of and the doctrine appealed neither to the understating nor to the heart."[44] Here one can guess why the German Romantics or others in Europe during this time looked for different sources and ideas whether Eastern or Western to give their feelings a language.

Sufi literature was a legitimate contender for attention of the Romantic poets. That is why Goethe's *Divan* is such a good specimen of Sufi literature, as Remy observes, "The thoroughness and earnestness of these studies is attested by the explanatory notes which were added to the *Divan* and were published with it in 1819, and which show conclusively that although Goethe could not read Persian poetry in the original, he nevertheless succeeded admirably in entering into its spirit."[45] The Sufi spirit of Persian poetry is not confined to his *Divan* which is an original work in its own right and inspired by Hafiz's *Divan* in every respect. Goethe's most celebrated work Faust shows Sufi concepts as well. Faust is no doubt an earlier work written when Goethe was not engrossed in Persian literature as he became in later life while writing the *Divan* but it reveals interesting departures from its predecessors in European and Christian traditions. When 'The Lord' asks Mephistopheles about his 'servant' Doctor Faust, Mephistopheles reply is,

> Forsooth! He serves you after strange devices: No earthly meat or drink the fool suffices: His spirit's ferment far aspireth; Half conscious of his frenzied, crazed unrest, The fairest stars from Heaven he requireth, From Earth the highest raptures and the best, And all the Near and Far that he desireth, Fails to subdue the tumult of his breast.[46]

The ecstatic rapture for the transcendence of the servant as reported by Mephistopheles taken by The Lord with positive sign, although his servant is 'perplexed' but his ambitions will lead him to a 'clearer morning' and the Lord promised a bright day for his confused servant. One cannot help seeing the Sufi dervish and his beloved God in this dialogue. Goethe re-created this Western Christian legend. In his creation, he altered Christian theme of the condemnation of Doctor Faust as over smart and over ambitious character who chooses the worldly happiness instead of God Grace – an absolute evil character. Whereas Goethe's Doctor Faust is forgiven and saved by a God ever merciful like the God of Sufis who is considerate to his servant's need and search for higher level of

being and most importantly Goethe's Faust is saved through a love affair with an innocent woman who prayed for his salvation.

Goethe was not alone in his love of the Persian mystics. Poets who followed him dug deeper in Sufi literature. Platen and Ruckert were devotees of the prince of classical Sufi poetry Rumi. Platen, according to Remy, was first to introduce actual Ghazal form of the Persian poetry into German literature. He published a version of Rumi's Ghazal in 1821. He also follows Goethe's convention of not only translating but creating original poetry in the manner of Persian traditions. Ruckert wrote Ghazals in Rumi's manner and published them in Gaselen series in 1821.[47] After meeting von Hammer the great orientalist and translator of Hafiz in Vienna in 1818, he started his study of Persian, Arabic and Sanskrit. According to Remy, his poetry was "generally regarded as translations from the Divan of Rumi…But the majority of poems are simply original Gazals in Rumi's manner."[48] Remy quotes many samples of his German poetry and poems from Hafiz's and Rumi's *Divans* to show the similarity of diction, and of similes, metaphors and images. Sometimes it seems that he is just paraphrasing the ideas expressed in the original poetry of Rumi and Hafiz.

In a similar passion the other Romantic poets like Heine, Bodenstedt and von Schack who were looking for Eastern wisdom became fan of the Persian sweet singers such as Hafiz and Rumi. Heine's main interest was in Indian myths but he did mention Saadi by calling him the Persian Goethe. According to Remy, he often called himself a 'Persian poet in exile' and he uses images and anecdotes from Persian poetry of Saadi, Jami and Firduasi. Bodenstedt was a more celebrated follower of Persian poetry. His *Songs of Mirza Schaffy* became so popular that according to Remy the collection of poems ran through one hundred and forty editions during the author's lifetime. The poems are fully oriental in nature and style and the images are from the Sufi traditions of Hafiz and Rumi. For example as Remy rightly notes: the image such as 'The tavern and the praise of wine', in one place poet invokes Hafiz by saying that 'Hafiz is his teacher and wine house is his masque', and in another place the poet celebrates the day when he leaves his masque for the 'tavern'. Another poet of this tradition was von Schack who visited the native towns of Firdausi and Hafiz out of respect and wrote a standard work on Firdausi. His poetry according to Remy shows striking parallels with another Persian poet Khayyam.

This German enthusiasm for Sufi literature did not go unnoticed by American and British writers. One of the greatest translators of

German Romantic literature into English was Thomas Carlyle who became an influential figure in eighteenth century American and British literature. His translations of Goethe, Herder, Schlegel and others published in American and English journals such as Fraser's Magazine were read and praised by scholars like Emerson and Ruskin. His writings and translations were very significant in introducing European Romantic sentiments to American readers who were experiencing their own version of the Romantic Movement called Transcendentalism.

There were important translations from French orientalists and other English writing reached American shores but Carlyle's personal friendship with a leading Transcendentalist like Emerson made him immensely influential. His attachment to German Romantics placed him apart from the evangelical orthodoxy of the Victorian period and earned him respect of people like Emerson and Ruskin. Shine writes in the introduction *to Carlyle's Unfinished History of German Literature*, after reading the German Romantics and Goethe, "from about 1825 henceforth for Carlyle…life had mystical meaning…he had penetrated as far as he felt the need to go in what he called metaphysics.[49] "Both Emerson and Ruskin commended Carlyle's lecture on the Prophet Muhammad [PBUH] the *Hero as Prophet* in his lecture series *Heroes and Hero-Worship*. Emerson in his 30 May 1841 letter to Carlyle praises his lecture as "abounding in truth and nobleness". He tells Carlyle that your audience in "London are less prepared to hear than is our New England one."

Carlyle in an earlier correspondence mentioned to Emerson how his audiences were shocked "because they had the impression that Muhammad was a quack and now they found out that he is a better Christian". Ruskin also mentions this lecture and also talks about reading Carlyle for understanding 'Arabia', in his letter of June 1878 he says, "I am working out some points in the history and geography of Arabia which I think will be useful, reading you and Gibbon! . . . you are very unsatisfactory about Mahomet's death."[50] In another place he writes, "Read some of Carlyle's lectures…I think, altogether approves of Mahomet, and talks like a girl of his black eyes."[51] Carlyle's sound and unbiased knowledge of Eastern literature, his involvement with German Romantics, and his close correspondence with two very influential writers of the American and English literature of nineteenth century showed the persistent resonance of Eastern literature in general and Persian Sufi literature in particular within the Western mind during and after the Romantic phase of European literature. German and other European Romantic writings

were well received in Emerson's America of Transcendentalists. Along with the Romantic literature Persian Sufi poems of Hafiz, Saadi, Attar and Rumi which by then were part of Romantic creed reached to the American Transcendentalists.

Emerson came to Europe in 1832 and met the high priests of the English Romantic movement Wordsworth and Coleridge and Carlyle introduced him to Goethe's poetry. Emerson's ideas had an impact on celebrated German philosopher Nietzsche whose notebooks contain reference to Emerson's writings.[52] American philosophy begins with Transcendentalist movement which was a rejection of church doctrine as the only means to gain spiritual truths. Emerson was the leading man in this philosophical movement and gave lectures all over America on spirituality and intuition. For him knowledge received from transcendental source through intuition and subjective awareness of self is superior and spiritually richer and therefore more religious and truthful then established church sermons and intellectual efforts. Unlike Kierkegaard and other European existentialist of his age his sources are not restricted to Christian literature and scripture and he seems to be inspired by much Islamic Sufi literature including The prophet of Islam and his closest relative Caliph and spiritual heir Ali. He quotes Caliph Ali who is the main source of all Islamic Sufi traditions. Almost all Sufi traditions trace their lineage to Ali's heritage of spirituality. Emerson in his essay *Self-Reliance* says, "Do not seek yourself out side yourself" which one can take for a direct quotation from Sufi literature, and then in the same essay he quotes the Caliph Ali, "'Thy lot or portion of life', said the Caliph Ali, 'is seeking after thee; therefore be at rest from seeking after it."[53]

In another essay called *Swedenborg, or the Mystic*, he discusses about eminent people who are 'most dear' to men and he considers poet, philosophers at top. Then he says "there is a class who lead us into another region" and these are the most eminent people. To identify this class of eminent people he quotes Persian Sufis and the Quran;

> The Koran makes a distinct class of those who are by nature good, and whose goodness has an influence on others, and pronounces this class to be the aim of creation: The other classes are admitted to the feast of being, only as following in the train of this. And the Persian poet exclaims to a soul of this kind: 'Go boldly forth, and feast on being's banquet; / Thou art the called – the rest admitted with thee.[54]

More significantly, he was aware of the orthodox line and the difference between the interpretation of the Quran by those who disregard metaphysical side of the story and his own position, which

comes from Sufi thought. But he also recognizes that in the same essay he says, "Mahometanism draws all its philosophy in its handbook of morals, the Akhlak-y-Jalaly, from him (Plato). Mysticism finds in Plato all its texts."[55] The handbook of morals Emerson is talking about is a Persian Sufi text and *jalali* is another word for Sufi means intoxicated and also full of transcendent knowledge. When he mention Platonic knowledge and Plato's debt to civilization in the same essay he means the Alexandrian School of Neoplatonism, he call them 'Platonists! The Alexandrians, a constellation of genius as Plato's men. " This returns us to the point made at the beginning of this chapter, that Sufi traditions and Western metaphysical thought have the same roots in the Neoplatonic system.

Transcendentalists, like Neoplatonists and Sufis, believed in the inherent goodness of the universe and the immortality and eternality of the soul. Transcendentalism was emerged in America against John Locke's and other European rationalism as well as against organised and institutionalised religion because for Transcendentalists organised religion and materialistic rationalization corrupt the inherent goodness of man. Emerson taught cosmic unity, in his theory of 'Oversoul' Emerson proposed, like Neoplatonic idea of Emanation and Sufi concept of constant revelation, the supreme animating spirit of the universe, which is linked with man's latent thought or intuitional form of knowledge. Lawrence discussed this idea with reference to Emerson, Whitman and Hardy in his philosophical essays most of which were written at the same time when he was working on his novel *Women in Love*. In his *Climbing Down Pisgah* which is a later essay survived as a typed script, Lawrence talked about Emerson's idea of 'Oversoul' called God, One Spirit and the Wholeness. However, he disagreed with Whitman's supposedly humanizing the idea of cosmic unity and wholeness as taught by Emerson and later by Hardy. Lawrence might be referring to Whitman's politicizing the mystic idea of cosmic unity with democracy and equality of man. Lawrence did not like the idea of equalizing the mystic cosmology with political and social slogan of equality of man advanced by many Western writers such as theosophical society of Madam Blavatsky.

Returning to English Orientalists of the Victorian period, British writers' enthusiasm for Persian language and literature became more significant as it turned out to be more academic based and pursuant of knowledge. Some of the bearucrates and diplomats of the Empire wrote very informative accounts of their journeys and even treatises

on the Persian poets and literature. Sir Gore Ouseley wrote the *Biographical Notices of the Persian Poets*, he was a British ambassador to Persia and he selected Persian names for his daughter and son. Another British diplomat John Malcolm's *History of Persia* was later according to Yohannan duplicated by Sir James Frazer. This work is also believed to be the early source of Mathew Arnold's poem *Sohrab and Rustum* along with French Orientalists works on Persian literature. According to Yohannan, 'this work contained one of the fullest early accounts of Soufeesim - and Sufi poets'.

Another diplomat James Justinian Morier based in Tehran wrote a novel called *Hajji Baba*. Duncan Forbes a professor of King's College, who regarded Persian literature as the French of the East, wrote a grammar of the Persian language for the purpose of the study of Persian literature in 1844. Another Victorian scholar Forbes Faloner translated a range of Persian texts including selections from the *Bostan* of Saadi, Jami's *Salaman and Absal* and most importantly Jami's treatise on Sufism – *Tuhfat-ul-Ahrar*. Many minor writers were influenced by Carlyle's lecture and published pieces on Persian literature those including Borrow, Milnes Thackeray and Tholuck who wrote on Sufi pantheism. However, further developments in publishing anthologies of Persian poetry were very significant with regard to the popularization of Persian literature among reading public. One such anthology called Rose Garden of Persian published by Luisa Costello. Yohannan notes that the poems in this anthology were taken from the Greaves collection available at Oxford University, and he also notes that the anthology ran through many editions and became a popular subject in magazine discussions of the day. Even a cotton manufacturer named Samuel Robinson published a series of translations from the major Persian poets including Nizami and some part of Rumi's Masnavi.[56]

The availability of so many Sufi texts during the first half of the nineteenth century and particularly the volume of published books and magazine pieces about Persian Sufi literature noted above during the first two decades of the Victorian period after the new language policy in India indicates the enduring legacy of the early orientalist involvement with Persian language and literature. The favourable view taken by English and German Romantics and those of American transcendentalists towards Sufi metaphysics in Persian literature became a great vehicle of influence and parallelism not only for later Victorian English writers like Arnold and Tennyson but the mystical charm of Sufi literature continued to be important to early twentieth century English literature.

However, here it is important to mention some more important literary figures of the later Victorian period with regard to their efforts in the study of Persian literature. One of foremost Persian scholars and enthusiasts Professor Edward Byles Cowell was influenced by Jone's work and went on to Oxford where he studied Persian manuscripts in the famous Bodleian library and translated many poems of Hafiz. According to Yohannan, while in Oxford he read Jami's mystical allegory *Salaman and Absal* together with Edward Fitzgerald. From Oxford, he travelled to India where he took a teaching job in Calcutta, while in India he famously found a manuscript of Khayyam's quatrains in the Asiatic Society Library of Bengal, which he sent to his Oxford friend Fitzgerald. This manuscript later became Fitzgerald's famous *Rubaiyat of Omar Khayyam* published in 1859. Cowell catches the spirit of Sufi thought when he says,

> The Sufis […] spring up apparently by a necessary law in the human mind […] The inherent love of mysticism, which lies in the heart, finds in every religion the necessary warmth to quicken it […]The Eleusinian mysteries, the Hindu Brahmanism, the Persian Sufeyism, and in our own time, the new German philosophy, are only development of the same deep rooted principles in the soul, under different outward circumstances of time and place.[57]

Though Cowell does not mention Plotinus's Neoplotanism, instead he equates Sufi ontology with the Greek mysteries of the ancient Mycenaean period that existed before Greek civilization. However, it is no more valid because Sufism is not mysterious of that kind of obscurity. Nonetheless, Cowell is right in his assertion and in his view that one should look towards Greek philosophical traditions for the roots of Sufi metaphysics in general and more interestingly in his parallelism with German metaphysics and Hindu Brahmanism. It is important to note that the most common concept within Sufi thought – Unity of being or oneness - also assumes a concept of a single source of existence which is not possible through the orthodox creation theory of the Abrahamic religions but through emanation. For example the mirror image in Sufi literature as we can see in Jami:

> All mirrors in the Universe I wee / Display thy image with its radiant sheen / Nay, in them all, soast thy effluent grace. / 'Tis Thyself, not Thine image that is seen.

In Rumi with more eloquence,

> Woman is a ray of God: / She is not the earthly beloved. / She is creative: you might say she not created.[58]

How the poet creates an image of creative nature of being and in this way Sufis are so successful in their delineation of the theme of unity of being. Because of emanation from the source, one strives hard to reunite with the source, which makes you complete and satisfied. In the history of metaphysics, this view is only possible, or one might say it is only existed in its totality in the Neoplatonic system. Plato's original theory of Form does not allow the unity of all being because there are many categories of Forms in the ideal world and not only one form for everything. In the multiple nature of different categories of Ideal Forms and in the Judeao-Christian tradition, including Islam, we have a dualistic theory – opposed to monism as discussed with regard to Neoplatonism and Sufism, theologies of all three religious traditions equal and independent existence of good and evil, creator and creature are emphasised, which does not allow oneness of being. Equally, in Zoroastrianism, there is the concept of two Agents 'light' and 'darkness' where existence of one is the absence or defeat of other. The only other parallel one can find, as Cowell observed, in Sankara's metaphysic in Hindu mythology where the concept of the unconscious intelligence called Parusa is the cause of all existence, all levels of being are emerging through him although Parusa is indifferent or unconscious of the lower levels of being – the material and sensible world. A similar notion of metaphysical reality proposed in Neoplatonism as argued in the first part of this chapter. D. H. Lawrence in his essay *Him With His Tail in His Mouth,* written in the same time as he was writing his philosophical essays such as *The Crown* and also the novel *Woman in Love,* has referred to the idea of creation in Indian metaphysics – 'Purusha'. Lawrence creates the interesting analogy of Dragon – the ancient symbol of immortality and creation as the same as Plato's Idea and the Parusa – the primal source from whose body the universe was created. The Indian myth also narrates that the final salvation is only possible when one can only get rid of this body by becoming the part of the Parusa's unconscious being. Lawrence even pursued his analogy of cosmic unity with Biblical theory of creation and he quoted Genesis's announcement that Jehova has created man in 'His Own Image', which indicates for Lawrence, that "the end is one with the beginning."[59] Lawrence regards creative process as a force and spark coming from the unknown, he notes that Henri Bergson's 'life-energy' or life force is the same is the ancient idea of 'logos' and 'dragon'.

Victorians interest in Sufi thought continues to be illuminating through such examples as Robert Vaughan who wrote *Hours with Mystics* which include Persian Sufism, and he notes Emerson's

sympathy with Sufi literature and thought. Important names of the Victorian English like Lord Tennyson and Mathew Arnold read and imitated Persian literature. One can find the images of 'the musk of the rose', 'the breeze of morning' and 'the planet of love' in Tennyson's poetry.[60] Tennyson in his letter to John Forster 1854 wrote, "A reason for my not writing much is the bad condition of my right eye which quite suddenly came on as I was reading or trying to read small Persian text."[61] Tennyson's closed association with Cowell, FitzGerald and Carlyle must have an effect with regard to his study of Persian literature. Arnold, who had a brother as Director of Public Instruction in The Punjab the land of Sufi saints in India, wrote his epic poem *Sohrab and Rustam* based on a legendry story in Firdausi's great epic *Shahnama*.

Although Tennyson's and Arnold's poetry does not have any deep Sufi imprint on it, the allusions to Persian literature in their works and their understanding of Persian literature shows the broader involvement of the Victorian age with Sufi thought found in Medieval Persian poetic works. The publication of FitzGerald's celebrated *Rubaiyat of Umar Khayyam* in 1859, which ran into more than twenty editions in just four decades was followed by another more important Sufi text, that of the renowned Sufi poet Farid-u-Din Attar's *Mantiq-al Tair*. FitzGerald's translation came with the title *TheBird Parliament* in 1862. E. H. Winfield's celebrated translation of Rumi's mystical poetry titled *Masnavi-I Ma'navi, the Spiritual Couplets of Maulana Jalalu'd-din Muhammad Rumi,* was published in 1889. These Sufi texts were read widely in Europe and America by general readers as well as by the authors and scholars. Sufi images and anecdotes become part of English language through such words as 'dervish', 'Imam', 'peer', 'faqeer', Sufi dance and many others. In this way elements of Persian Sufi literature become part of English during the course of the nineteenth century.

In 1857 the Indian soldiers of the East India company revolted against the company rule in India which resulted the direct rule of the English Queen in India. The British Empire became more and more entrenched into the life and society from the Indian Sub-Continent to Afghanistan. The trips and travels from Britain to India and other South Asian countries became more frequent.

Although colonial snobbery and the perceived higher status of the colonial master in general prevented English men and women from learning a great deal about the culture and belief systems of the subjugated people, the academic pursuit of oriental knowledge never abated but rather accelerated during the later part of nineteenth

century. Yohannan observes two major factors in Victorian England – one an obstacle to Sufi thought and the other helpful in allowing Sufi literature and metaphysics to prevail. He notes the nineteenth century English evangelical dislike of Sufism in Persian literature as an obstacle to Sufi thought's approval in the literary circles. Because of the conservatism and puritanical traditions in the Victorian England, the Sufi thought might not have welcomed in many quarters.

The other thing Yohannan notes is the newfound kinship with the Persian people and their language, which developed through William Jones's theory of the Indo-European family of languages and consequently the Aryan race and common ancestry. The view that Persians have common ancestors with European people and their language and literature is one of their own and different from Semitic people and traditions made Europeans more sympathetic towards their Persian kinsmen. The idea of evangelical dislike and also colonial snobbery might be applicable to the public at large as these were the realities of the age which was no doubt in a time of conservative bourgeois and evangelical puritanism. Nonetheless, these repressive concepts could also have been the very reason for many to seek the fresh air of freedom and release through Sufism's literature of rebellious unorthodoxy. The phenomenal popularity of Khayyam's Rubaiyat, the Masna'vi of Rumi and Hafiz's Ghazal in the late nineteenth century, texts which celebrate drunkenness, wine and love of flesh but give them a deeper mystical and religious meaning show another aspect of the age. The later Victorian age and the early twentieth century manifest this rebellious mood when the crisis of representation in art became an important issue for many artists. As Yohannan observes, by the twentieth century "Emerson in America and the Victorians in England had successfully accommodated [Persian literature] to English modes of thought and forms of speech."[62]

The pursuit of the discovery and translation of Sufi texts remained an important mission in literary circle in early twentieth century as well such as the new translations of Mahmood Shabistri's *Gulshane Raz*, Hakeem Sana'i's *Hadiqat-al Haqiqat* and Nicholson's eight-volume edition of Rumi. However, the important thing to say here is that more and more researchers and literary critics became conscious of Sufi literary writings and their influence and importance in contemporary Western society. Serious academic work such as R. A. Nicholson's *A Historical Enquiry Concerning the Origin and Development of Sufism* in 1906 shows the importance of academic

involvement with Sufi thought and its history. It is interesting to note that Arthur F. J. Remy of Columbia University was exploring and appreciating the impact of Sufi poets on German Romantics in 1901. So, one can see as early as in the beginning of the Twentieth century the feeling existed in the academic circles that the impact of the Persian poetic traditions and its Sufi themes had been significant for past two centuries. The impact of oriental humanism, as manifested in Sufi traditions and present in Buddhist and Hindu mythologies, was taking shape in Western society.

Literary clubs like the Omar Khayyam Club and a more ambitious social movement the Theosophical Society was formed. The Omar Khayyam Club was established in the late nineteenth century with famous member such as Thomas Hardy, Viscount Wolselev, Sir George Robertson and others. The club met annually at a dinner for the celebration of Khayyam's poetry and his love of humanity. Helena Blavatsky's Theosophical Society was formed during the same time with a similar view of the universal brotherhood of humanity. Encouraged and inspired by such literary and social movements many dervishes both real and fake ones visited Western countries and many Western individuals visited dervishes and khanqas of the east in search of their own subjective truths.

One such esoteric thinker was Georgei Ivanovitch Gurdjieff who spent many years in company of Eastern dervishes and gurus in Constantinople, Central Asia, India, and Tibet. He claimed having occult knowledge, set up the Institute for the Harmonious Development at Fontainebleau in France where novelist Katherine Mansfield died. Among his disciples was Richard Orage the influential editor of *English Weekly* and *The New Age*. According to Galin Gurdjieff's esoteric ideas influenced many writers of the early twentieth century including Ouspensky, Huxley and Isherwood. Apart from pseudo-oriental ways of esotericism and the search for the truth of ancient and Medieval Eastern wisdom proposed by new humanistic and spiritual societies, there was a realization among genuine philosophical circles that ninetieth century realism and the materialist approach to the understanding of the cosmos was not sustainable.

Conclusion

In the light of the preceding discussion of the Romantic and post-Romantic writers of the West and their encounters with the Persian Sufi literature in the eighteenth and ninetieth centuries, it can be said that parallels already existed in Eastern and Western metaphysical

traditions from the early and later Middle Ages. It can be safely concluded that medieval Islamic Sufi literature in particular and Islamic metaphysical writings in general remained an important contributor to the development of modern western metaphysics.

Notes and References

[1] Young, Julian, *The Death of God and Meaning of Life*, Routledge, London, 2003, p. 21

[2] Kreisel, Howard Ed, *Study and Knowledge in Jewish Thought*, Ben-Gurion University of the Negev Press, Beer Sheva, 2006, p. 38

[3] Kenny, Anthony, *A New History of Western Philosophy* V. II, Medieval Philosophy, Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2005, p. 204

[4] Kenny, Anthony, *A New History of Western Philosophy* V. II, Medieval Philosophy, Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2005, p. 29.

[5] Robinson, Prof. Thomas, *On the Study of Oriental Literature*: An Introductory Lecture Delivered at Cambridge, British Library Rear Books, 1838, p. 10

[6] Morewedge, P. ed., *Neoplatonism and Islamic Thought*, State University of New York, Albany, 1992, p. viii

[7] Scholem, Gershom G., *Major Trends in Jewish Mysticism*, Schockem, New York, 1974, p. 77

[8] Harris, R. Baine, Ed., *Neoplatonism and contemporary Thought*, State University of New York Press, New York, 2002, p. 324.

[9] Camus, Albert *Christian Metaphysics and Neoplatonism*, trans. Ronald D. Srigley, University of Missouri Press, Missouri, 2007., p. 31

[10] Lyon, Jonathan, *The House of Wisdom: How the Arabs Transformed Western Civilization*, Bloomsbury, 2009, London, p. 45

[11] Morewedge, P. ed., *Neoplatonism and Islamic Thought*, State University of New York, Albany, 1992, p. 23

[12] Morewedge, P. ed., *Neoplatonism and Islamic Thought*, State University of New York, Albany, 1992, p. viii

[13] Kenny, Anthony, *A New History of Western Philosophy* V. II: Medieval Philosophy, Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2005, p. 36

[14] Kenny, Anthony, *A New History of Western Philosophy* V. II: Medieval Philosophy, Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2005, p. 25

[15] Kenny, Anthony, *A New History of Western Philosophy* V. II: Medieval Philosophy, Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2005, p. 38

[16] Kenny, Anthony, *A New History of Western Philosophy* V. II: Medieval Philosophy, Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2005, p. 39

[17] Aquinas, Thomas, *Aquinas on being and essence.* A translation and interpretation by Joseph Bobik, University of Notre Dame Press, Notre Dame, Ind., 1965, p. 345

[18] Kenny, Anthony, *A New History of Western Philosophy* V. II: Medieval Philosophy, Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2005, p. 33

[19] Gibb, H. A. R., *Arab Literature: An introduction*, OUP, Oxford, 1926, p. 186

[20] Gibb, H. A. R., *Arab Literature: An introduction*, OUP, Oxford, 1926, p. 198

[21] Gibb, H. A. R., *Arab Literature: An introduction*, OUP, Oxford, 1926, pp. 193-4

[22] McGann, Jerome J. ed. *The New Oxford Book of Romantic Period Verse*, O. U. P, Oxford, 1993, p. xxi
[23] McGann, Jerome J. ed. *The New Oxford Book of Romantic Period Verse*, O. U. P, Oxford, 1993, p. 27
[24] McGann, Jerome J. ed. *The New Oxford Book of Romantic Period Verse*, O. U. P, Oxford, 1993, p. 83
[25] Arberry, A. J. *British Orientalists*, William Collins, London, 1943, p. 18
[26] Arberry, A. J. *British Orientalists*, William Collins, London, 1943, p. 22
[27] Ibid.
[28] Hott, Ted and Gilroy, John, *A Commentary on Wordsworth's Prelude Books I-V*, Routledge and Kegan Paul, London, 1983, p. 116
[29] Whinfield, 1898, p. 73
[30] Bate, W. J., 'Coleridge, Transcendentalism, the organic view of Nature', in Mahoney, John L. (Editor) *The English Romantics: Major Poetry and Critical Theory*, D. C. Heath and Company, Toronto, 1978, p. 719
[31] Bate, W. J., 'Coleridge, Transcendentalism, the organic view of Nature', in Mahoney, John L. (Editor) *The English Romantics: Major Poetry and Critical Theory*, D. C. Heath and Company, Toronto, 1978, p. 711
[32] Bate, W. J., 'Coleridge, Transcendentalism, the organic view of Nature', in Mahoney, John L. (Editor) *The English Romantics: Major Poetry and Critical Theory*, D. C. Heath and Company, Toronto, 1978, p. 41
[33] Yohannan, John D., *Persian Poetry in England and America: A 200 – Year History*, Caravan Books, New York, 1977, p. 74
[34] Robinson, Prof. Thomas, *On the Study of Oriental Literature*: An Introductory, Lecture Delivered at Cambridge, British Library Rear Books, Source, 1838, pp.1-2
[35] Byatt, A. S., *On Histories and Stories*, Harvard University Press, Harvard, 2001, p. 167
[36] Gibb, H. A. R., *Arab Literature: An introduction*, OUP, Oxford, 1926, p. 180
[37] Hellerich, Siegmar V., *Religionizing, Romanizing Romanatics: The Catholico-Christian Camouflage of the Early German Romantics; Wackenroder, Tieck, Novalis, Friedrich and August Wilhelm Schlegal*, Peter Lang, New York, 1995, p. 39
[38] Hellerich, Siegmar V., *Religionizing, Romanizing Romanatics: The Catholico-Christian Camouflage of the Early German Romantics; Wackenroder, Tieck, Novalis, Friedrich and August Wilhelm Schlegal*, Peter Lang, New York, 1995, p. 185
[39] Hellerich, Siegmar V., *Religionizing, Romanizing Romanatics: The Catholico-Christian Camouflage of the Early German Romantics; Wackenroder, Tieck, Novalis, Friedrich and August Wilhelm Schlegal*, Peter Lang, New York, 1995, p. 155
[40] Bowie, Andrew, *From Romanticism to Critical Theory: The Philosophy of German Literary Theory*, Routledge, London, 1997, p. 67
[41] Bowie, Andrew, *From Romanticism to Critical Theory: The Philosophy of German Literary Theory*, Routledge, London, 1997, p. 14
[42] Hellerich, Siegmar V., *Religionizing, Romanizing Romanatics: The Catholico-Christian Camouflage of the Early German Romantics; Wackenroder, Tieck, Novalis, Friedrich and August Wilhelm Schlegal*, Peter Lang, New York, 1995, p. 184
[43] Hellerich, Siegmar V., *Religionizing, Romanizing Romanatics: The Catholico-Christian Camouflage of the Early German Romantics; Wackenroder, Tieck, Novalis, Friedrich and August Wilhelm Schlegal*, Peter Lang, New York, 1995, p. 241

[44] Goethe, J. W. von, Hoffmann, E. T. A., Kant, I., Melanchthon, P., Storm, T. W., Tieck, L. & Series, G. H. *The Anthology of German Literature*. G. H. Series ed., 2010, p. 68

[45] Remy, Arthur F. J., *The Influence of India and Persia on the Poetry of Germany*, New York: Ams Press, INC., 1966, p. 24

[46] Goethe, J. W.von, Hoffmann, E.T.A., Kant, I., Melanchthon, P., Storm, T. W., Tieck, L. & Series, G. H., *The Anthology of German Literature*. G. H. Series ed., 2010, p. 971

[47] Remy, Arthur F. J., *The Influence of India and Persia on the Poetry of Germany*, New York: Ams Press, INC., 1966, p. 38

[48] Remy, Arthur F. J., *The Influence of India and Persia on the Poetry of Germany*, New York: Ams Press, INC., 1966, p. 39

[49] Shine, Hill ed., *Carlyle's Unfinished History of German Literature*, Haskell House Publishers, New York, 1973, p. xxiii

[50] Cate, George Allan ed., *The Correspondence of Thomas Carlyle and John Ruskin*, Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1982, p. 241

[51] Cate, George Allan ed., *The Correspondence of Thomas Carlyle and John Ruskin*, Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1982, p. 28

[52] Trombley, Stephen, *A Very Short History of Western Thought*, Atlantic Books Trombley, London, 2011, p.77

[53] Emerson, Ralph Waldo, *Ralph Waldo Emerson: Essays and Lectures*, The Library of America, New York, 1983, p. 117

[54] Emerson, Ralph Waldo, *Ralph Waldo Emerson: Essays and Lectures*, The Library of America, New York, 1983, pp. 421-422

[55] Emerson, Ralph Waldo, *Ralph Waldo Emerson: Essays and Lectures*, The Library of America, New York, 1983, pp. 633-4

[56] Yohannan, John D., *Persian Poetry in England and America: A 200 – Year History*, Caravan Books, New York, 1977, p.99

[57] Yohannan, John D., *Persian Poetry in England and America: A 200 – Year History*, Caravan Books, New York, 1977, pp. 73-4

[58] Nicholson, Reynold A., *A Rumi Anthology*, One world, Oxford, 2000, pp. 56-57

[59] Lawrence, D.H., *Reflections on the Death of a Porcupine and Other Essays*/ D.H. Lawrence; Edited by Michael Herbert, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge: 1988, p. 309

[60] Yohannan, John D., *Persian Poetry in England and America: A 200 – Year History*, Caravan Books, New York, 1977, p.78

[61] Yohannan, John D., *Persian Poetry in England and America: A 200 – Year History*, Caravan Books, New York, 1977, p. 91

[62] Yohannan, John D., *Persian Poetry in England and America: A 200 – Year History*, Caravan Books, New York, 1977, p. 217