

IQBAL REVIEW (64: 3)

(July - September 2023)

ISSN: P0021-0773

ISSN: E3006-9130

HAMILTON GIBB'S CRITICISM OF THE THOUGHT
OF ALLAMA IQBAL – AN ANALYSIS*

Dr. Shukri Albaji

ABSTRACT

Hamilton Gibb was a contemporary of Allama Iqbal, but he did not speak on this subject until seven years after the death of Allama Iqbal, until in 1945 he gave a lecture program at Hescal Institute for Study of Comparative Religion and started a discussion on it. These lectures were later published in book form in 1947 under the American University of Chicago. This meant that the whole debate started by Hamilton Gibb was one-sided which is against the basic principles of any intellectual debate because any debate on any intellectual matter is to be purposeful and productive. The way to do this is to have both sides present so that their stated views can be compared and moderated to arrive at a conclusion. It is easier than for researchers and scholars who are doing research in the field of Islamic studies and religious renaissance to reach a point of view on the final opinion

* This paper was read at the Second International Intellectual Conference *Muhammad Iqbal: Al-Istasbraq Wal Mustasharqoon* organized by Zaytouna University Tunis and the Embassy of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan Tunis on March 30, 2022 at Zaytouna University.

formed. It seems from Hamilton Gibb's style of discussion that he analyzed all the thoughts of Allama Iqbal and explained his reasoning with a lot of contradictions and fallacies, and his style prevailed in all his later academic endeavors. It is mainly based on Allama Iqbal's book *The Reconstruction of Religious Thought in Islam*. Hamilton Gibb continues his discussion and research on the ideas of Allama Iqbal. Gibb did not acknowledge any merit of Allama Iqbal and if he acknowledged any merit of Allama Iqbal at some level, he immediately changed his position. He says that Allama Iqbal's courage and sincerity in his efforts should be acknowledged, but at the same time he says that courage and sincerity alone are not enough for this work. And in this way he completes his statement by withdrawing from the virtue he was admitting and says that Iqbal cannot be defended except we may say that in his new knowledge of theology Allama Iqbal laid some foundations which later could be supplemented with further elaboration to formulate a complete ethical system which will be of special importance in the coming period.

More than seven decades have passed since the death of Allama Iqbal. During this time, as a result of the research on Allama Iqbal (1877- 1938AD/1249 -1357AH) in the Arab world, the Muslim world and the West, a large and extensive collection of works and theses has been compiled. In this work a detailed review of his thought has been done in terms of prose, poetry and thought. From these detailed studies and written books, it can be estimated that Allama Iqbal's thought was researched and thought about in detail. However, there is a further need to revive Allama Iqbal's intellectual discussions and covaluate them critically.

There is no doubt that Allama Iqbal still holds an important position in the academic and intellectual circles and even today he is a source of interest and an important subject of the intellectual movement. The scholarly need for reflection and research on Allama Iqbal's thoughts is still significant to explore the depth of the meaning of his poems and writings. His thoughts should be critically and comparatively evaluated in the context of Eastern and Western academic circles, philosophers, researchers, Orientalists and intellectual traditions.

Here it can be asked why the thought and philosophy of Allama Iqbal and his poetry and prose and the message given in it should be made the subject of discussion and research today. What is left in Allama Iqbal's thoughts that can be made a subject of research or on which a new concept of knowledge can be based.

How is it possible to answer the question which is raised to reduce the importance of Allama Iqbal's thought?

In this context, many questions are asked.

Such questions demand from us courage and research without any fear or mistrust, and the only way to address such points that diminish the importance of Iqbal's thought is to explain and interpret Iqbal's thought. In addition, what has already been said should not be repeated and instead of repeating the existing discussions to explain the purpose of Allama Iqbal's thought, let us advance our discussions with intellectual freshness.

Dr. Javed Iqbal,¹ who is also the author of the biography of his father Allama Iqbal,² has written that the study of Allama Iqbal due

to the research and writings of scholars on Allama Iqbal's personality, poetry and his academic heritage has taken the status of a field of knowledge in which many scholars and researchers are presenting their research. Utilizing the collection of scholarly endeavors and researches of these scholars not only enlightens our consciousness but also facilitates the path of understanding Iqbal.

In this context, when a group of scholars started researching and discussing Allama Iqbal compared Allama Iqbal with ancient Islamic thinkers such as al-Farabi and Ibn Sina or medieval Muslim thinkers such as Imam Ghazali, Ibn Rushd and Ibn Khaldun or the prominent authentic thinkers of the modern era, such as Jamaluddin Afghani and Muhammad Abdahu, it has become the subject of study and research due to their numerous writings and knowledge. In this way, different types of intellectual and research materials continued to be compiled without any interruption or pause.

Due to this interest of the scholars, this point has become very important to explore the reasons behind the high position of Allama Iqbal, due to which Allama attained this high position, so that the continuous research interest of the scholars can be maintained. Whenever there is a mention of the revival of religious thought and its related discussions, the mention of Allama Iqbal is also a part of our discussions.

So the question remains before us that what was the basis that made Allama Iqbal to such a high position.

It should be kept in mind that the scholarly discussions about Allama Iqbal have raised four critical and appreciative positions around him, which are different due to their starting point and environment, which are the Arab world of Islam, Europe, Egypt, are related to the environment of Iran, Pakistan and United Kingdom etc and can be described as follows:

First: This is the critical approach that Hamilton Gibb described³ and interpreted in his book *Modern Trends in Islam*. It was published in 1966 by the Hashim al-Husseini, Maktaba al-Hayat Beirut.

Second: The second position was explained by Muhammad Al-Bhi⁴ in his book *Al-Fikr al-Islami al-Hadith Wassilat al-Istimar al-Gharbi*. This book was published in 1957.⁵

Third: The third position has been explained by Shaykh Murtaza Al-Mutahari⁶ in many of his books.

Fourth: The fourth critical and research position is that of Fazlur Rehman,⁷ which he explained in his book *Islam and Modernity*. This book was published in 1982.⁸

While living in the same scope, the famous English orientalist Hamilton Gibb, who specializes in Islamic studies, has started this discussion in his book *Modern Trends in Islam*,⁹ and this discussion is one of the earliest discussions of Allama Iqbal's basic concepts and ideas. We have made this discussion our topic because it was started by Hamilton Gibb, an important academic figure according to the eminent critic Edward Said.¹⁰ It has been mentioned by Edward Said in his book *Orientalism*.¹¹ Edward Said is considered one of the prominent people in the field of Islamic studies in the Anglo-American world. The famous Orientalist John Fok¹² has mentioned it in his book *History of the Orientalist Movement*,¹³ where he has described Edward Said as the first representative of Arab and Islamic studies in America.¹⁴ Abdul Majeed Al-Qaisi has also described Hamilton Gibb as a well-known British and orientalist. He translated Gibb's book *The Islami Society and the West* which was published by Gibb in collaboration with Herald Boun in 1950.

But according to the well-known scholar Abdul Rahman Badawi (1917-2002)¹⁵, the fame that Gibb got was much more than his academic status, because the importance of what he wrote or the services he rendered academically is less than this fame.¹⁶

In this context, when we look at Gibb's scholarly works, he has made two important figures in the field of national renaissance as his subject, Sheikh Muhammad Abdahu¹⁷ of Egypt and Allama Muhammad Iqbal of the subcontinent. Here it should also be kept in mind that the people who worked on this subject before Gibb made the subject of Egypt and the Arab world, especially Muhammad Abdahu, in relation to its renaissance, as Charles Adams¹⁸ mentioned it in his book *Islam and Modernity of Egypt*.¹⁹ This book was published in 1933.

In this regard, Thomas Arnold²⁰ is also worth mentioning, who was also the teacher of both of them, and after the death of Thomas Arnold, Hamilton Gibb was awarded the Chair of Arabic Languages at the University of London in 1930, and he was the editor of the British edition of the *Islamic Encyclopaedia* after him.²¹

It is worth mentioning here that Hamilton Gibb was a contemporary of Allama Iqbal, but he did not speak on this subject until seven years after the death of Allama Iqbal, until in 1945 he gave a lecture program at Hescal Institute for Study of Comparative Religion and started a discussion on it. These lectures were later published in book form in 1947 under the American University of Chicago. This meant that the whole debate started by Hamilton Gibb was one-sided which is against the basic principles of any intellectual debate because any debate on any intellectual matter is to be purposeful and productive. The way to do this is to have both sides present so that their stated views can be compared and

moderated to arrive at a conclusion. It is easier than for researchers and scholars who are doing research in the field of Islamic studies and religious renaissance to reach a point of view on the final opinion formed. It seems from Hamilton Gibb's style of discussion that he analyzed all the thoughts of Allama Iqbal and explained his reasoning with a lot of contradictions and fallacies, and his style prevailed in all his later academic endeavors. It is mainly based on Allama Iqbal's book *The Reconstruction of Religious Thought in Islam*.

There are three main reasons why Gibb fell victim to fallacies and contradictions in these debates:

The first reason is that the source of Hamilton Gibb's research is *The Reconstruction of Religious Thought in Islam*. He wanted to clarify the relationship of this book with the spirit of the modern period because according to him, after Egypt and the Arab world, the subcontinent had taken a central position for the development of Islamic thought and this period was also close to the modern period and the West. Secondly Hamilton Gibb wants to know is how Allama Iqbal represented him in terms of the modern Islamic community. Thirdly according to Hamilton Gibb, Allama Iqbal made the first complete attempt to reconstruct Muslim thought through these lectures.²²

According to Hamilton Gibb, Allama Iqbal is the figure in India whose trends and intellectual approach were not only accepted by the people of India, but he was also representative of the intellectual approach of current trends in the Muslim world and his poetry reflects all these facts. It became a mirror to describe the liberal romanticism, collective tendencies of the youth and their yearning for freedom.²³ Moreover, all the Muslims of India who were troubled by the religious, social and political problems of their times saw in the person of Allama Iqbal a leader who was calling them to the goal of freedom.²⁴

Hamilton Gibb says that Allama Iqbal represents the main image of modern Islamic society. But after stating this, he also says that Iqbal also represents the negative trends of scholarly endeavors. Allama Iqbal strongly criticized the concept of patriotism and his poems later became the national anthem of India. Iqbal also advocated the establishment of the state of Pakistan, but his poetry is full of many contradictions, though commentators after him tried to remove these contradictions and find a rhyme and connection in them.²⁵

At the end of his book, Hamilton Gibb states that Allama Iqbal's findings are very flawed. Criticizing the work of his commentators

and later writers on Allama Iqbal, he says that nothing seems more distressing than the fact that scholars who have often worked on Allama Iqbal repeat over and over again the scholarly achievements of their predecessors. Apart from that, they do not talk about anything new.²⁶

The center of Hamilton Gibb's research and thought is Allama Iqbal's book *The Reconstruction of Religious Thought in Islam*. Because this is the book that directly deals with the topic of modern trend in Islam. This book is also the first comprehensive attempt at reconstructing ilm al-kalam, but it is surprising that Hamilton Gibb does not mention this book throughout his discussion. Rather, while mentioning this book and Islamic theology, he mentions six lectures. That is, as if this is not a book, but actually six lectures. As he begins his discussion on Iqbal, Gibb says that in his six lectures on the formation of modern Islamic theology, Muhammad Iqbal discussed the problem of creating a systematic system of Muslim knowledge and disciplining the fundamental concepts of Islam.²⁷

In this way, Hamilton Gibb continues his discussion and research on the ideas of Allama Iqbal. He does not know anything about this book, but instead of this book, his knowledge is limited to the status of these lectures, which are titled from the first lecture to the sixth lecture, as he also mentions it in his discourse.

As far as the contradictions and conflicts in Allama Iqbal's thought are concerned, Hamilton Gibb says that Allama Iqbal started his lectures with the purpose but he could not achieve the purpose that he had set himself at the end and completion of the lectures, that is to say, to reconstruct the existing Muslim knowledge of Al-Kalam and to reconstruct it as a religious thought. Instead to reconstruct the religious thought his lectures are linked to intuitive experience of mystics. Its roots are connected to Bergson,²⁸ the father of irrational romanticism.²⁹

While describing the contradictions of Allama Iqbal in the context of Western civilization and culture, Hamilton Gibb presents two main arguments:

- i. Hamilton Gibb believes that on the one hand, Allama Iqbal comes out as a great defender of Western culture because he himself was greatly influenced by it, but at the same time, he is also a strong critic of Western institutions and organizations.
- ii. When Hamilton Gibb states that the results of Allama Iqbal's lectures were contrary to his intentions. He also states that the intellectual trends emerging in the West gradually transformed Christianity into a humanistic religion, because they depended too much on scientific considerations and concepts regarding the laws of nature, lest these trends that arose in the Muslim world should be applied to Islamic beliefs and religion as a result

of similar studies and convert it to human religion. Gibb emphasizes that the humanistic tendencies in Iqbal's philosophy may produce similar results because we find its basis in Bergson's illogical philosophy.³⁰

Hamilton Gibb believes that one weakness of Allama Iqbal's thought that makes him stand out among other thinkers of his time is that he consistently uses verses from the Qur'an to prove his position in lectures. Gibb raised two questions about Allama Iqbal's this approach:

The first question is whether these verses quoted from the Qur'an represent all the points of view of the Qur'an. A serious reflection on it leads us to the conclusion that there is a very clear gap between the meanings of these verses, the religious guidance contained in them and the concepts derived from these verses by Allama Iqbal.³¹

The second question is that according to Hamilton Gibb if Allama Iqbal adopted this method so that he could advance his position with intellectual purity and originality, then there was no benefit in adopting this style because it led to such a fallacy, which destroyed the entire project of reconstructing the thought of Islamic theology.

These are the most important points of view that Gibb has described regarding this work of Allama Iqbal *The Reconstruction of Religious Thought is Islam*. After reviewing all the ideas of Hamilton Gibb, it can be said that Gibb has consistently refrained from praising any virtue of Allama Iqbal and if he has agreed with any position and arguments of Allama Iqbal, even then, he did not acknowledge the intellectual greatness of Allama Iqbal as he should have done, but instead tried to prove his superiority over Allama Iqbal everywhere and tried to reduce his importance and intellectual status. It is prominently featured in Hamilton's above-mentioned book.

Gibb did not acknowledge any merit of Allama Iqbal and if he acknowledged any merit of Allama Iqbal at some level, he immediately changed his position. He says that Allama Iqbal's courage and sincerity in his efforts should be acknowledged, but at the same time he says that courage and sincerity alone are not enough for this work. And in this way he completes his statement by withdrawing from the virtue he was admitting and says that Iqbal cannot be defended except we may say that in his new knowledge of theology Allama Iqbal laid some foundations which later could be supplemented with further elaboration to formulate a complete

ethical system which will be of special importance in the coming period.³²

All of Hamilton Gibb's criticism of Allama Iqbal came out in the context of his book *The Reconstruction of Religious Thought in Islam*. Taking a general review of Gibb's criticisms, it can be said that Gibb not only refrained from appreciating Allama Iqbal's position and academic excellence, but also hesitated to agree with some of his ideas. He does not acknowledge the greatness of Allama Iqbal. He asserts his own superiority and supremacy in all his ideas, and seems to reduce the importance of Allama Iqbal and weaken his intellectual and intellectual position and status.

All of Hamilton Gibb's criticism of Allama Iqbal came out in the context of his book *The Reconstruction of Religious Thought in Islam*. Taking a general review of Gibb's criticisms, it can be said that Gibb not only refrained from appreciating Allama Iqbal's position and academic excellence, but also hesitated to agree with some of his ideas. He does not acknowledge the greatness of Allama Iqbal. He asserts his own superiority and supremacy in all his ideas, and seems to reduce the importance of Allama Iqbal and weaken his intellectual and intellectual position and status.

Hamilton Gibb's approach to Allama Iqbal can be summarized in two dimensions. First, the direction of Hamilton Gibb's research is determined by his interest in Allama Iqbal's concepts and ideas. This is to say that Allama Iqbal deviated from the path of researchers and scholars who defended religion and articulated positions that could be applied to modern thought. Gibb believes that Allama Iqbal's attempt to reconstruct Muslim thought represents the notion that the formation of a systematic Muslim *ilm-ul-kalam* is the basic need and central concern of Islam. When Gibb describes this point of view, he also says that this scholarly achievement of Allama Iqbal is the first complete attempt to reconstruct Muslim thought.³³

According to Hamilton Gibb, Allama Iqbal's intellectual efforts are an important element representing the modern Muslim society, but the way Allama Iqbal completed his intellectual achievement is a manifestation of academic frustration according to Hamilton Gibb.

According to Hamilton Gibb's research, Allama Iqbal is like the thinker who covered all current and contemporary intellectual trends in the Muslim world of the subcontinent. In the case of Allama Iqbal, the Muslim society of the sub-continent was under the guidance of a figure who was making progress towards the restoration of the true glory of Islam, but at the same time, Gibb describes Iqbal as a thinker who sought to destroy Western civilization and a staunch defender of the culture from which he accepted great influence, he is also highly critical of various Western institutions according to his likes and dislikes.

Another aspect of Gibb's approach is that here he seems to be trying to downplay the importance of Allama Iqbal and the statements and concepts he expressed. Then he describes Allama Iqbal's concepts and ideas as contradictory which he has described in two places in his book.

One is where Gibb wrote about the contradictions of Allama Iqbal that Allama Iqbal increased the internal academic and intellectual chaos and conflict of the subcontinent through his intellectual efforts and the other when he says this while describing the contradictions of Iqbal, that when Allama Iqbal tried to reconstruct Muslim knowledge, he ended it by going to the formation of Sufi theology. In this way, according to him, Iqbal's philosophical efforts ended in intellectual confusion and the third place where he describes Iqbal's intellectual achievements as immature and always tries to prove them wrong. Gibb repeatedly states that the ideas expressed in Allama Iqbal's *The Reconstruction of Religious Thought in Islam* culminated in the intuitive experience of the Sufi method, which was originally attributed to Allama Iqbal's illogical romanticist thinker Henri Bergson.³⁴

There is no doubt that the whole of Hamilton's discussion is an Orientalist narrative emanating from an Orientalist mind and is confirmed by everything that an Orientalist has to say about his knowledge, his attainments, his assumptions, his impressions and his points of view. Therefore, Hamilton Gibb's position is biased, and his reading and writings about Allama Iqbal should be read and understood in the context of this bias.

Edward Said has tried to explain and prove this is the fact in his book *Orientalism*. He presents Hamilton Gibb as a complete Orientalist with classical Orientalism and prides himself on calling himself an Orientalist rather than an expert on Arab affairs.³⁵ Edward Saeed has also described him as a biased orientalist. Edward Said has described this approach as the biggest obstacle in the way of understanding modern Islam and has also called Hamilton Gibb an anti-Islam and expressed surprise at his approach and raised the question that why should modern Islam be confronted with such apparent animosity as Hamilton Gibb is doing?³⁶

In this regard, I must present one of my observations as worthy of mention here, that in terms of research and academic topics, Hamilton Gabb's *Modern Trends in Islam* and Allama Iqbal's book *The Reconstruction of Religious Thought in Islam* are academically similar. Because both books cover these discussions of Islamic studies.

I have not seen any scholars and researchers who have noticed or pointed out such similarities between the two. I don't know what similarity Malik bin Nabi saw in his book *The Destination of Islamic World* and Gibb's book *Modern Trends in Islam*, but what is even more surprising is that he did not find any similarity in his scholarly position with that of Allama Iqbal.

A very noteworthy point in this regard is that Malik bin Nabi (1905-1973/1322-1393AH)³⁷ has shown his closeness with Gibb's bias, which is seen in his above-mentioned book and the way he has viewed Allama Iqbal's approach in a critical manner, it seems that he is under the influence of Gibb in deciding the position regarding Allama Iqbal. It is very rare that Malik Bin Nabi ever supported the views or ideas of Allama Iqbal.

The fact that Malik bin Nabi had no knowledge about Allama Iqbal's book *The Reconstruction of Religious Thought in Islam* cannot be ignored. Whenever he classified Muslim knowledge in his book *The Destination of Islamic World* and wherever he referred to Allama Iqbal, he relied on the same ideas about Allama Iqbal instead of quoting from his original book.

According to my study, if viewed beyond bias, Allama Iqbal's book is more profound, logically sound and effective than Hamilton Gibb's book. I am saying this on the basis of a detailed study of both books, a critical evaluation of the information presented in their textual analysis and the manner of its presentation, but the fact is that Allama Iqbal's conclusions are a rejection of the points which Gibb has repeatedly stated in his book and has tried to cast doubt on Allama Iqbal's position and ideas.

The first point is that Gibb completely ignores the aspect that Allama Iqbal has brought together poetry and thought at a very high level because he was blessed with a very high poetic quality and intellectual ability. On the one hand, he was a very talented poet who had distinguished poetic experience and which he understood well, on the other hand, he was a very high-level thinker and had intellectual experiences that not only distinguished him from the rest of the people, rather, he was aware of it, but while acknowledging his intellectual greatness, Dr. Majid Fikri said that no thinker in the 20th century has reached the intellectual stature that Allama Iqbal achieved.³⁸

Whenever Gibb wants to discuss the ideas of Allama Iqbal, he mentions them as the voice of Allama Iqbal that we hear in his six lectures for the reconstruction of the religious thought of Islam.³⁹

As far as the Arabic translation of Hamilton Gibb's book is concerned, I have not seen anywhere that Gibb has mentioned the name of Allama Iqbal's book, if he has mentioned it somewhere in the English book, I don't know about it.

On the other hand, as far as the influence of Iqbal's poetry and thought is concerned, this matter is beyond all doubt and controversy. No proof is needed for this. Allama Iqbal's poetry and thought were able to send a message to the world that he went beyond the borders of the subcontinent of Pakistan and India, even his message reached the Arab world, Muslim countries and Europe from where his books on philosophy and translations of his poetry were published.

Allama Iqbal's books like *Asrar Khudi* were translated into English long before the translations into other languages. Allama Iqbal published this Persian collection in 1915. It was translated into English in 1920 by the well-known English Orientalist Nicholson.⁴⁰ While its Arabic translation was published in 1956 by Dr. Abdul Wahab Azzam (1894-1959/1311-1379 AH). This is called the first book of Allama Iqbal's literary, intellectual and biographical introduction in the Arab world.⁴¹

Iqbal's thought reached the whole world and it was not limited to the borders of India, Pakistan and sub-continent but this thought reached Arab countries, Islamic world and European countries.

This contradiction is repeated again and again that Allama Iqbal's academic and intellectual writings reached Europe before they became common in the Arab countries and the Islamic world. His PhD thesis, *The Development of Metaphysics in Persia*, which was presented by Allama Iqbal at Munich University in Germany in 1908, was published in English in 1908 from London. For which Allama Iqbal also wrote a letter in English language along with the recommendation of his English teachers.

While the Urdu translation of his PhD thesis was published in 1936 under the name of *Falsfa-e Ajam*. This translation was done by Mir Hasanuddin, an Indian writer which was in the knowledge of Allama Iqbal and published with his permission. While the Arabic translation of his book was published in 1986 by Hussain Mujib Al-Misri (1916-2004/1335-1425 AH).⁴²

Regarding the recognition of Allama Iqbal's greatness at the world level, it is also very important that Germany also recognized the greatness of Allama Iqbal and to express their commitment to Allama Iqbal, they established a monument in the University of Munich, on which Allama Iqbal's name and words of praise from German people are written. They often compare Allama Iqbal with famous German poet Goethe (1349 - 1832 AD) and sometimes they compare Iqbal with famous German philosopher Nietzsche (1844 - 1900 AD). They have also translated some books and writings of

Allama Iqbal into German language and acknowledge Allama Iqbal as a great philosopher.

Whenever a person has the talent of poetry and ability of thought, it creates an extraordinary balance in his personality and his intellectual position and status is very high. The lyrical faculty heightens and universalizes the flight of imagination, while the intellectual faculty expands insight and wisdom. In poetry, power comes from eloquence, while thought gives meaning power, force and effectiveness. The art of poetry awakens our conscience and the art of thought creates lights in the chambers of the human mind. The God-given ability of poetry is a means of influencing the common people through which when the thought is conveyed to the common people, it directly affects their character.

These two high talents and abilities not only strengthened Allama Iqbal intellectually but also made him a high academic position. His poetic prowess increased his circle of influence and gained him wide public attention, while his scholarly work, intellectual achievements, philosophical reflections and achievements strengthened his intellectual standing and scholarship. The attention of scholars was drawn to his thought and philosophy. It is a matter for us to think about how Allama Iqbal achieved this great position by using these two abilities.

The second thing is that Allama Iqbal combines these two tendencies without creating any contradiction between spirituality and rationality or denying either of them. On the one hand he has a clear spiritual tendency which is evident in his life, attitudes, thought and academic achievements while on the other hand he has a clear rational disposition and thought which is clearly visible in his philosophical thinking. Allama Iqbal's books, writings and his thought cannot be divided into separate parts in such a way that spirituality and rationality be separated in his thought and writings. The trend of spirituality is very prominent in Allama Iqbal's personality and can be seen flowing throughout his life, even his writings and thought cannot be seen by dividing or limiting them into only intellectual or spiritual domain.

It is very clear that no evidence is needed to describe the spirituality of Allama Iqbal. He grew up with this tendency in his family from his childhood and this tendency became a part of his personality. He acquired a taste for spirituality under the influence of his father, Sheikh Noor Muhammad, who was known as a person with strong Sufi tendencies and this tendency remained with Allama Iqbal throughout his life. In his childhood, he listened to the lessons of *Fatubat Mukijya* and *Fusus al-Hikam* of Sheikh Akbar Muhyiddin Ibn Arabi (1165-1240AD/560-638AH) in the company of his father.

And these lessons remained a part of Allama Iqbal's memory throughout his life until Sufism became a part of his life.

When Allama Iqbal narrates the events of his early life, he says that I do not condemn Sheikh Akbar Muhyiddin Ibn Arabi. My father was a scholar who was well versed in the discussions of Shaykh Akbar's works i.e., *Fatubat Mukiya* and *Fusus al-Hikam* and I first heard the names of these books when I was only four years old and had just started reading. These two books were in our house for years, although I could not understand these books or their discussions as a child, but I was definitely present in these learning circles and then as I mastered the Arabic language, I also started to understand these two books and thus I got more knowledge and experience about these two books and the demand and desire to get more knowledge about these books also arose in my heart.⁴³

This spiritual tendency was present in the personality of Allama Iqbal even when he studied European philosophy very deeply and mastered it. He inherited this inclination from his ancestors and this tendency has been further matured after studying European philosophy.⁴⁴

Even when Allama Iqbal's position regarding Sufism changed, this taste and trend of spirituality did not decrease in his personality when he strongly criticized and rejected Wahdat-ul-Wujud prevailing in Sufism. Because he believed that this concept was against monotheism and when he rejected this concept, he strongly criticized it and described it as negation of self, self-exploitation and inaction which was visible in Sufi literature and attitudes. And he declared this philosophy of unity of existence in conflict with the philosophy of practicality and practical life and expressed it in his book *Asrar Khudi* which was published in 1915. This book started the biggest scholarly and literary battle of its time, with a great wave of criticism because Allama Iqbal criticized the Iranian poet Hafiz Shirazi (1325-1388/726-791AH) and his Sufi poetry. The intellectual tendencies of Allama Iqbal are clear from his philosophical thinking, philosophical analysis and deep association with modern European philosophy. Allama Iqbal called reason and the method of reason as a decisive factor for the human mind and said that the final victory of the human mind is the victory of reason.

In Allama Iqbal's book *The Reconstruction of Religious Thought in Islam*, moderation and combination of spirituality and rationality is seen. In this book he completed his philosophy in a very transparent, very appropriate and organized manner. He wanted to restore the lost moderation and balance between the philosophy of East and

West. The philosophy of the West, which was purely rational and devoid of spirituality, needed to acquire spiritual tendencies to achieve moderation, and the philosophy of the East, which was spiritual in nature, needed to be harmonized with moderation and rational trends of modern age.

The importance and value of this fact and Allama Iqbal's attempt to achieve moderation and balance in the Muslim world of knowledge comes to light when we are aware of the clear division between Imam Ghazali and Ibn Rushd in the medieval period of Muslim thought. Al-Ghazali was victorious in spiritual orientations while Ibn Rushd was superior in intellectual orientations. So Islamic thought remained divided into two distinct classes. Some thinkers sided with Imam al-Ghazali and his spiritual tendencies and some followed Ibn Rushd and his intellectual tendencies and an approach that could reconcile these two tendencies and bridge the distance between them was constantly absent.

The third aspect is that Allama Iqbal has the position of the most prominent Muslim philosopher of the modern age among ancient and modern Muslim philosophers. Furthermore, Allama Iqbal was not a mere researcher or a teacher of philosophy or an imitator of the philosophies of others in order to explain the philosophies described by them in a better way.

Allama Iqbal has explained that his philosophy is the result of twenty years of intellectual and spiritual struggle, research and exploration of the depths of knowledge and wisdom, during which he studied the philosophers of the world in detail and pondered over them to reach the destination and he provided arguments to defend the view he adopted and also raised questions on the ideas of Muslim and Western thinkers and philosophers.

Through the method adopted by Allama Iqbal to formulate his philosophical thoughts, he reached a very vigorous and dominant philosophy, which has serious and deep features and he got a special recognition among other philosophers, especially Western philosophers. They not only acknowledged his greatness but also took interest in his thought. In the philosophy presented by Allama Iqbal, there are three types of experiences which he pondered over for a long time, got his taste and went through his findings. These three types of experiences are: spiritual experience, poetic experience and philosophical experience.

Every philosophy that goes through these three types of experiences, on the one hand, it gets intellectual wealth, and on the other hand, it becomes perfect and interconnected, and in this perspective Allama Iqbal's philosophy must be compared to other philosophies. The superiority and distinction attained by him is filled with any one of these three types of experiences and each of these

experiences has its own continuity, taste and distinction. It has its own history, communication, dominant influences, brilliance and revelations.

Moreover, in the modern era of Islam, Allama Iqbal represents the few thinkers who have referred to ancient and modern philosophers, including Muslim and European philosophers, in their thought and philosophy. The same work has been done by some Arab and Muslim researchers and in this scope, Dr. Usman Amin (1905-1987) has compared Allama Iqbal and the German philosopher Kant. According to him, Iqbal has done the same feat in the history of Islamic thought as Kant did in the history of Western thought.⁴⁵

In the same sequence, Dr. Majid Fakhri has compared Iqbal with Abu Hamid al-Ghazali because the level of academic achievement that Iqbal achieved in his book *The Reconstruction of Religious Thought in Islam* in terms of creating harmony in sciences, thoughts and philosophy. Keeping the requirements of his time in view, Al-Ghazali performed the same job in *Ihya Uloom al-Din* thousand years ago.⁴⁶

The fourth aspect is that Allama Iqbal is an example of a thinker who preserved his identity while reading all kinds of philosophies and did not alienate himself from his identity. He is a thinker whose early love and affinity was for philosophy which led him to study philosophy at universities in the UK and Germany. There he studied modern European philosophies in depth and honed his knowledge with the breadth and depth of his studies, and his European teachers found him to be an intelligent student capable of great attention and academic training.

Contact with European philosophers was not unusual for Iqbal as he had been with the English Orientalist Thomas Arnold (1864-1930) for a long time and this association extended from India to Britain. He was Arnold's student in the Department of Philosophy since his MA in Government College, Lahore, where Dr. Arnold was Professor of Philosophy in 1891. In Britain and Germany, where Iqbal received his doctoral studies and stayed for three years from 1905 to 1908, during this time and even after returning from Europe, Allama Iqbal continued to have a relationship with Dr. Arnold until his death in 1930.

Describing the impact of this relationship, Javed Iqbal wrote that Dr. Arnold stimulated Allama Iqbal's philosophical taste and encouraged him to go to Europe to complete his education. He was admitted to Trinity College, University of Cambridge. Dr. Arnold

also helped him find a suitable place to live there and published his doctoral thesis from London in 1908. This book was also attributed to Dr. Arnold.⁴⁷

Thus, it became easy for Allama Iqbal to master Western thought and become the best intellectual who understood European civilization. This is the case with many Arab and Islamic world scholars who have gone through the same experience as Allama Iqbal, who after understanding Western thought are organizing and presenting their concepts and philosophy about Islam and the ideas of Islam.

Allama Iqbal was very clear in this regard. Not only for the Muslims and the Muslim world, but also for the Europeans and Americans, Allama Iqbal was a religious thinker who had extensive knowledge, information and understanding about European philosophers and civilization.

The fifth aspect is that it is also said about Allama Iqbal that he is among the few thinkers who used the Holy Quran as his source for philosophical ideas. A source from which sometimes he derive his thoughts, and sometimes he uses the verses of the Holy Quran to justify his thoughts, and sometimes he takes arguments from the Holy Quran to explain another thought.

In this regard, Allama Iqbal has presented many moral, intellectual and philosophical ideas which he derived from the Holy Quran and these are the ideas that we find very clearly in his book *The Reconstruction of Religious Thought in Islam*.

Majority of the scholars who have read the book of Allama Iqbal have seen this feature with great clarity that Allama Iqbal stood firm on it. This is the reason why it is possible to discuss this aspect of Iqbal's thoughts as a separate feature, because Allama Iqbal tried to explain his thoughts in the light of the Holy Qur'an and presented his point of view. In this regard, he did not refer to the thoughts of the ancient and modern commentators of the Qur'an, nor did he associate himself with any commentator in any degree of proximity, and perhaps he did so intentionally without expressing his purpose.

When we focus on this distinction of Allama Iqbal, the reason for this is that we do not see any such interest or aspect in the large number of scholars and thinkers of the Arab and Muslim world, who are proving through their efforts that they have taken the Holy Quran as an obsolete book.

Allama Iqbal firmly believes that the Holy Quran is the source and source of his personal philosophy of self and the Holy Quran is the source and foundation of his philosophical thoughts and philosophical formation and this source has reformed his mystic method and thought.

The sixth aspect is that Allama Iqbal is considered a representative figure of the era of renaissance and reformation. Allama Iqbal's personality and his prominent intellectual trend, along with his influence and scholarly work and dominant literary trends, testify to the fact. Furthermore, Allama Iqbal is not only considered to be the figure of renaissance and reform in the Indian subcontinent, but his influence of renaissance and reformation has spread to the distant lands of the Muslim world through his literature, writings, thought and movement.

Regarding Allama Iqbal's thoughts on revival of the Muslim nation and reform of the nation, Javed Iqbal, his son, writes in his father's biography that Iqbal went through an intellectual revolution regarding his thoughts when he was in Cambridge and when he submitted his doctoral thesis to the University of Munich in 1907. Meanwhile, Allama Iqbal was faced with the question that what are the reasons for the decline and backwardness of Muslims?

Taking this view, Javed Iqbal has relied on the opinion of the Indian writer Ikramul Haq Saleem who wrote that Iqbal was to prepare an article on Islamic politics for an English magazine in Cambridge. During this time, the question arose in his mind that what are the psychological factors behind the decline and backwardness of Muslims. To answer this question, Iqbal examined several references, but could not reach any satisfactory and satisfactory conclusion. After that moment, he began serious research to find out the causes of the decline of Muslims and the backwardness of their civilization and began to struggle to discover how a true Islamic renaissance could be achieved.⁴⁸

According to Javed Iqbal, it was this change that decisively and ultimately turned Allama Iqbal's poetry towards Islam. In the words of the Indian writer Khalifa Abdul Hakim, who writes that Iqbal took a decisive path and a clear decision that he would spend the rest of his life writing poetry aimed at promoting Islam. He believed that there will be a renaissance and he used to say that this was the wish of his father who always advised him to dedicate his life and poetic talent to Islam and serve Islam.⁴⁹

Probably, these are the prominent features and factors due to which Allama Iqbal got a higher and prominent position in the academic and intellectual history.

NOTES AND REFERENCE

- 1 Javed Iqbal: Born on October 5, 1924 in Sialkot, son of Allama Muhammad Iqbal and his second wife Sardar Begum, his mother died when he was 11 years old, and his father died in 1938 when he was 14 years old. He is the son of poet-philosopher Allama Muhammad Iqbal who played an important role in the Pakistan Movement. Javed Iqbal authored various books on Pakistan Movement and political ideology and philosophy. He was a senior judge of the Supreme Court of Pakistan. Before moving to the Supreme Court, he was the former Chief Justice of the Lahore High Court. He is internationally known for his popular publications in philosophy, law and modern thought in international and national journals. He died on 3rd October 2015.
- 2 Judge Javed Iqbal passed away, *Al-Fajr* (Akhbar), October 4, 2015. Retrieved October 21, 2019. Iqbal, Javed, *Zinda Rood*, Poet of the East and Poet of Islam on Life, Allama Muhammad Iqbal (Translation), Majlis-ul-Aali Lal-Thaqafah, Cairo, 2005, (2/226).
- 3 Gibb Hamilton (1313-1391AH/ 1895-1971AD) was a famous English orientalist, who was born in Alexandria, Egypt and died in Oxford. An Arabic language academy employee in Cairo, he published many books and translations in the fields of Arabic literature, Islamic history and modern Islam.
- 4 Muhammad al-Bahi: (1905-1982AD), one of the most important figures in modern Islamic thinkers. Confronting opposing ideologies, exposing colonialism and its role in Islamic societies, al-Bahi left a large collection of books that enriched Islamic thought and Islamic scholarship.
- 5 See: Al-Bahi, Muhammad, *Al-Fiker al-Islami Hadith Wassilah in Istimar al-Gharbi*, Maktaba Wahba, Cairo.
- 6 Murtaza Muthari (1919-1979AD) Iranian theologian, Islamic philosopher, thinker and writer. He was one of the ideologues of the Islamic Republic of Iran. He is one of the most prominent students of the Islamic commentator and philosopher Muhammad Husayn Tabatabai, who is the author of an extensive network of Islamic radical, theoretical and philosophical works. He has many books on various branches of Islamic sciences and these have been translated into various languages. Motahari is considered among the most influential members and leaders of the Islamic Revolution in Iran. He was appointed as the head of the Revolutionary Command Council. The Iranian government celebrated his martyrdom day as Teachers' Day in Iran.
- 7 Fazlur Rahman: (1919-1988) A great Pakistani Islamic thinker who left a legacy after his death which is still being discussed and analyzed in most western universities and international cultural forums.
- 8 What is available to us is the following publication, Al-Rahman, Islam and the need to follow the hadith: *Nahw Ihdath Taghyeer fi al-Taqalid al-Thaqafiyah*, (Tr) Ibrahim al-Aris Dar al-Saqee, 1st edition, al-Tabbat al-Awli, 1993AD.
- 9 His book *Modern Trends in Islam* is one of his most famous books, although he is not the most famous in his field. This book is a reflection of Gibb's interest in the study and analysis of the trends of Islamic thought and the nature of the developmental trends within it and the influence of Western thought on these trends, and where it is going and what its future holds. *Islam to Where proceed?* this title is taken from the material in which Gibb participated in the editing of this book which was published in 1932. Also included in this scope is his book *The Islamic Society and the West*, which he published in 1991 in collaboration with Harold Bowen, when he studied

the influence of Western thought on Turkey and its Arab countries since the early nineteenth century. Thus, he has some other books in the field of Islamic studies, such as *The Renewal of Religious Thought in Islam* published in 1948, *Islam: A Historical Survey* published in 1949, *Studies on Islamic Civilization* published in 1962.

The book *Modern Trends in Islam* is originally a series of lectures Gibb gave at the Haskell Institute for the Study of Comparative Religions in 1945. This lecture was delivered under the framework of the program organized at the University of Chicago in the United States of America. The program is devoted to the study of specific dimensions and trends in religions in general and the nature of relationships between different religions. See: Hamilton, Gibb, *Wal-i-Tajahat Hadith in Islam*, *Majla Al-Kalma*, No. 50 for the thirteenth year, winter 2006AD/1427AH.

<http://kalema.net/home/article/list/667/1>, 2006

- 10 Edward Said: Palestinian researcher, writer and American citizen. He is a literary thinker, university professor and educationist. He wrote several books on literary criticism, music criticism and post-colonial issues. Participated in protests for Palestinian rights in the United States. He worked for forty years at Columbia University for English language and comparative literature, and became famous for authoring the book *Orientalism* in 1978. Talked about the assumptions of the Western world that lead to misunderstanding about the symbols of the civilization of the East, especially the Middle East. The book has been translated into several languages, and is taught in many political science classes.
- 11 Saeed, Edward, *Orientalism (Translation)* by Kamal Abu Deb, Muassisa Abhath Al-Arabiya Institute, Beirut, 2001.
- 12 Fock, Johann (1894-1974), German Orientalist.
- 13 Fock Johan, *History of the Orientalist Movement, Arab and Islamic Studies in Europe*, translated from German: Umar Lutfi al-Alam, Dar al-Madar al-Islami, second edition, 2001AD. The Orientalist movement, arising as it did as a religious reaction to missionary aims, after the defeat of the Muslims in their first contact with the East, the Church called upon the Orientalists to distort the identity of religion so the West should not be affected. It tells us how the separation between this movement and the missionary aims of the Church came about, and it became a single discipline, and this book takes us from the rise of Islam to the middle of the last century in Europe. It tells about the Arabic sciences which has a very long period, so it was a long story and it contains many names and personalities of the Orientalists and the schools of thought that followed them, the books and researches they authored, and references they have relied on in their research.
- 14 Gibb and Bowen Harold, *The Islamic Society and the West*, translated by Abdul Majid Al-Qaisi, Dar Al-Huda, Damascus, 1997AD, (1/17)
- 15 Abd al-Rahman Badawi (1917-2002) in Cairo, one of the most distinguished Arab professors of philosophy in the twentieth century, as his works included more than 150 books of research, translation and authorship. Some Arabs interested in philosophy consider him to be the first Egyptian existential philosopher, heavily influenced by some European existentialists, specially from German philosopher Martin Heidegger.
- 16 Badawi, Abd al-Rahman, *Mosua Al-Mustashriqin*, Al-Arabiya Institute for

- Studies and Publishing, Beirut, 2003, p. 174.
- 17 Muhammad Abdah bin Hussain Khairullah was born in 1849 in Mohalla Nasr village of Buhaira area of the Delta to a rural family at a time when peasant families were victims of unfair taxes and laws imposed by the government. One of the first pioneers of Islamic renaissance and supporter of reform and renewal.
- 18 Badawi, Abd al-Rahman, *Encyclopedia of Orientalists*, previous reference, p. 174.
- 19 Publication available to us: Charles Adams, *Islam and Reformation in Misr*, (translation) Abbas Mahmud, revised by Ahmad Zakaria al-Shalq, al-Makruz al-Qoumi for translation, Cairo, Egypt, 2015.
- 20 Thomas Walker Arnold (1864-1930) was a famous British Orientalist who began his academic career at Cambridge University, where he developed his love of languages, so he learned Arabic and worked as a researcher in Aligarh where he spent ten years. During this time he wrote his famous book *The Preaching of Islam*, then worked as a professor of philosophy at Government College Lahore, and in 1904 he returned to London to become a professor. He was also Assistant Secretary to the Library of the Indian Government Department of the British Foreign Office. He also worked as a part-time professor at the University of London and was a member of the editorial board of the first edition of the *Islamic Encyclopedia*, published from Leiden, Holland. He worked as a visiting professor at Egypt University in 1930. He was a prominent British orientalist and historian of Islamic art. He also attended Aligarh University, then Aligarh College, and Government College of Lahore University. He was a friend of Sir Syed Ahmad Khan and wrote famous book *The Preaching of Islam*. He was the teacher of poet and philosopher Muhammad Iqbal. He was also a friend of Shibli Naumani who was also a teacher at Aligarh Muslim University.
- 21 Al-Bahi Muhammad, *Al-Fikr-e-Islami connected with Western colonization*, Maktaba Wahbat, Cairo, 1991, p. 379.
- 22 Gibb's book *Modern Trends in Islam* and Muhammad Iqbal's book *The Reconstruction of Religious Thought in Islam* have a lot of similarities in terms of research topic, nature of problems and intellectual perspective. This similarity between the two books helps us to understand the scope of consideration in criticizing and analyzing the ideas and concepts presented in Gibb's book, in which we see without prejudice that Iqbal's book is different from Gibb's book, deeper, stronger and perfect. I say these words because of my treatment of both books and the analysis of their writings and the formation of scholarly criticism, and because Iqbal has repeatedly denied what Gibb has tried to suggest. Casting doubt on Iqbal's ideas and theses, Hamilton Gibb writes in his book *The Call to Renew Islam* that closing the door to ijihad effectively ends the principle of movement in Islam. As Muhammad Iqbal wrote in his book. See: Hamilton Gibb's book *Modern Trends in Islam*, previous reference.
- 23 Gibb, Hamilton, *Modern Trends in Islam*, (Translation) Hashim al-Husseini, Maktaba dar al-Hayat, Beirut, 6691, p.88.
- 24 م ن ص ن
- 25 Gibb, Hamilton, *Modern Trends in Islam*, op. cit., pp. 731-98.
- 26 Ibid, pp. 137-89.
- 27 Ibid, p. 20.
- 28 Henri Bergson (1859-1941) French philosopher, won the Nobel Prize for Literature in 1927. Henri Bergson is considered one of the most important philosophers of modern times. His influence was wide and deep. He

introduced a new pattern of thought and a new style of expression. He left his impact on the entire intellectual movement in the fifties, and he tried to save the values that had been destroyed by materialistic ideology, and reaffirmed spirituality as an unwavering faith. His philosophy gained great popularity in France, even after the end of the Second World War, until now it has been a niche. Bergson's enormous popularity caused controversy in France, where his views were seen by the authorities as opposing the secular and scientific position.

- 29 Gibb, Hamilton, *Modern Trends in Islam*, op. cit., pp. 115-151.
- 30 Ibid, p.114.
- 31 Ibid, p.116.
- 32 Ibid, p.116.
- 33 Ibid, pp. 20-89.
- 34 Ibid, p.151.
- 35 Said, Edward, *Orientalism*, (Translation) Kamal Abu Deb, Al-Arabiyya Research Institute, Beirut, 2001AD, p.83.
- 36 Ibid, p.116.
- 37 Malik bin Nabi (1905-1973AD) is one of the most prominent Islamic thinkers of the twentieth century. The Algerian thinker Malik bin Nabi is considered one of the pioneers of the Islamic intellectual renaissance in the twentieth century. Malik bin Nabi's efforts in the formation of modern Islamic thought and the general study of civilizational issues were extraordinary. He was the first person to present a specific approach to examine Muslim problems based on psychology, sociology and history.
- 38 Fakhri, Majid, *Tarikh al-Filsafat al-Islamiyyah* from the 8th century till today, (Tr) Kamal Ilyazji Majid, Dar al-Sharooq, Beirut, 2000, p. 541.
- 39 MN, p.109.
- 40 Reynolds Nicholson (1886-1945) was an English orientalist who specialized in Sufism and Persian literature and is considered one of the best translators of Jalaluddin Rumi's poetry. Many of his articles were published in *Encyclopedia of Religion and Ethics* and *Encyclopedia of Islam*.
- 41 Abdul Wahab Muhammad Hassan Azzam is one of the most prominent Arab thinkers of the twentieth century. He was a professor, writer, writer, thinker, poet, translator and politician.
- 42 Hussain Mujib al-Misri, born in Cairo in 1916, received a Bachelor of Arts from Cairo University in 1939, a Diploma in Turkish and Persian Studies from the Institute of Oriental Studies of Cairo University in 1942, and a PhD in 1955. He was fluent in eight languages and wrote poetry in Arabic, Persian, Turkish and French. Taught Sufism. He is now working as a professor at Ain Shams and Al-Azhar universities and as a specialist at the Arabic Language Academy in Cairo.
- 43 Iqbal, Javed, *Zinda Rood*, op cit, (1/115).
- 44 Ibid, (2/186).
- 45 Bouazizi, Muhammad Al-Arabi, *Muhammad Iqbal Fikra al-Dini wa al Falsafi*, Dar al-Fikr, Damascus, 1999, p.139.
- 46 Fakhri, Majid, *Tarikh al-Filasfah al-Islamiyyah*, op cit, p. 534.
- 47 Iqbal, Javed, *Zinda Rood*, op cit, (1/153, 207, 210, 222).
- 48 Ibid, (2/152-153).
- 49 Ibid, (2/91).