

COMMUNICATING THE
INCOMMUNICABLE: THE NATURE AND
AUTHENTICITY OF RELIGIOUS
EXPERIENCE IN ISLAMIC SUFI
TRADITION

Dr. Tahir Hameed Tanoli

Abstract

This paper examines religious experience in the Sufi tradition, highlighting its role as a bridge between human effort and divine grace. It argues that reliance solely on intellect can cause distress, while immersion in divine grace brings peace. Through the practice of remembrance (*dhikr*), individuals can transcend personal attributes and deepen their awareness of the Divine. The paper contrasts the states of *sukr* (intoxication) and *sahw* (sobriety) in divine encounters, suggesting that true religious experience arises from balancing outer struggle and inner devotion, with visible effects on the world. It emphasizes the importance of being attentive to God's presence and critiques the suspension of consciousness as a potential spiritual weakness. Utilizing Qur'anic narratives like those of the People of the Cave and the Battle of Badr, the paper illustrates how spiritual observers can perceive various possibilities within the same temporal context. It discusses the challenges of articulating profound spiritual experiences, which, though often seen as incommunicable, can be symbolically expressed and validated through tangible outcomes. Iqbal's reflections further explore the relationship between spiritual experience and scientific inquiry, emphasizing the importance of three stages of awareness—self-awareness, awareness through others, and awareness of the Divine. The conclusion asserts that true religious experience leads to steadfastness and stability, aligning individuals with divine truth and reinforcing their moral integrity.

In the Sufi tradition, religious experience is seen as a deeply personal encounter with the Divine, characterized by states of heightened awareness that defy conventional language. This paradox lies at the heart of Sufi mysticism, where practitioners seek to convey the ineffable nature of their experiences through symbolic expressions, poetry, and metaphors. Figures like Allama Iqbal emphasize that while spiritual insights may appear incommunicable, they can still serve as powerful evidence of divine truths when expressed authentically. Authenticity in religious experience is rooted in its transformative effects on the individual and their moral integrity, reflecting a harmony between inner experiences and observable outcomes in the external world. Thus, the challenge of communicating these sacred experiences not only highlights the limitations of language but also reinforces the deep connection between personal revelation and communal understanding within the Sufi path.

According to the Sufis, religious experience is a bridge between human effort and divine grace. They rely solely on intellectual and practical effort leads to distress, while receiving divine guidance and blessings brings peace.¹ Immersing one's actions in divine grace through religious experience is a way to safeguard oneself from the potential pitfalls of one's own efforts and struggles. This is because, in this state, the divine attributes dominate the senses and qualities of the individual. Through the mental state² achieved by remembrance (*dhikr*), the individual's personal and human attitudes, goals, and attributes fade away. In this way, they reach a state of being absorbed in the mental attitude of the remembrance of God.

In other words, when the majesty of God overwhelms human consciousness, the individual becomes annihilated in their self and experiences an enduring awareness of the presence of the Divine. When the love of God or the awareness of His presence overcomes a person, they lose control over their own actions because their conscious mind cannot handle the intensity of this experience. However, this is not a psychological disorder. Instead, it is an experience of a superhuman being's control over the individual's actions, the effects of which are observable in the external world. Wherever the Qur'an attributes an action either to the human level or to the level of divine influence, the results and consequences are different. This means that it is possible for an action performed by

a human to be beyond human capability. In such instances, due to the individual's absorption in the Divine, the action that emerges from the human is essentially a divine act. Actions performed on an ordinary level are human, while those that occur at an extraordinary level are an expression of divine union.³ For example, the Prophet Muhammad's (PBUH) Ascension (*Mi'raj*) was not an ordinary event but a divine act. The experience of intense love or the overwhelming presence of God penetrating human consciousness is not simply a state of intoxication or incapacitation. Rather, it is an active awareness of God's presence, whose effects and results are observable in the external world.

Religious experience is the act of seeing the Divine with the inner eye, meaning perceiving the manifestation of the Divine in the heart, whether in solitude or in company, without any need for analysis. There are two aspects to achieving this observation: one is attained through firm belief, and the other through the overwhelming love of God. In one case, a person sees an object or action with their physical eyes and notices the actor behind it. In the other case, the person, absorbed in the love of the actor, overlooks everything else and sees only the actor. The first aspect of observation relates to reasoning, while the second pertains to inner passion. Through reasoning, one proves the existence of God with evidence, while in the second state, the seeker is enraptured and overwhelmed by longing.⁴ Here, reasoning and facts become veils for the seeker. The seeker's own self becomes a conscious sign of the presence of the Divine.

According to scholars, the inner vision's observation is connected to the struggle of the outer self. If the struggle of the outer self does not form the foundation for inner observation, the experience remains limited to delusion and imagination. When inner observation results from outer struggle, it leads to steadfastness in the struggle and the manifestation of its effects in the external world. Scholars argue that the form of observation produced by *dhikr* and contemplation, which remains merely in the realm of imagination, cannot be considered as the true observation of the Divine with the inner eye.⁵ This is because whatever enters human intellect about the Divine is purely conjecture. The only authentic observation of the Divine is one that results from a deep-rooted integration of external and internal ethics, leading to observable effects and results in the external world. The characteristics of religious experience according to the Islamic mystical tradition are outlined here below:

1. Physical Effects of Religious experience

The beginning of religious experience is marked by the effects it has on the human body, states, and conditions. In Surah Al-Ma'idah, verse 83, the Qur'an describes how, when the faithful hear the words of Allah and recognize them as divine, they are overwhelmed with sorrow and begin to weep, with tears flowing from their eyes. Upon recognizing the truth of Allah's message, they long to become among those who have witnessed this reality. A similar sentiment is expressed in Surah Az-Zumar, verse 22, where it is mentioned that the Qur'anic verses have meanings and effects that resonate and reinforce each other. When believers hear them, they recognize their truth, feel a deep reverence for Allah, and are so affected that their skin shivers. Their hearts and minds become softened and inclined toward the remembrance of Allah.

The Qur'an describes this as a step toward guidance. In other words, this is a step towards the state of openness and inner expansion (*sharh al-sadr*), a stage of guidance described in the previous verse (22) of the same Surah.

2. *Sukr* (Intoxication) and *Sahw* (Sobriety)

During religious experience, it is natural for the observer to experience the states of *sukr* (intoxication) and *sahw* (sobriety). *Sukr* refers to a state of unconsciousness, while *sahw* refers to a state of being conscious. When the intense spiritual experiences of the observation cause the observer to fall into a state of *sukr*, it results in the suspension of human reasoning, contemplation, and even the sense of self (*khudi*) disappearing. If *sukr* is based on a strong moral and spiritual foundation, then only the forces beyond the limits of human nature remain active when the individual's normal faculties are suspended, and this state is quite rare.⁶

However, in the state of *sahw*, the observer, despite being absorbed in the observation, retains stability and continuous awareness. Syed Ali Hujwiri explains the difference between these two states by giving the example of the renowned Sufi Abu Othman al-Maghribi. Early in his spiritual journey, he spent twenty years in such deep solitude that he didn't even hear a human voice, and his physical appearance changed significantly. After twenty years, when he returned to human society and met the spiritual leaders in Mecca, they asked him: "How did you spend these twenty years? Why did you remain in solitude, what did you gain, and why did you return?" Abu Othman al-Maghribi replied: "I left

in a state of *suker*. I experienced the afflictions of *suker*, fell into despair, and returned out of helplessness. ” The spiritual leaders responded: “Bravo! You have clarified the difference between *suker* and *sabw* so clearly that further discussion on the matter is unnecessary.”⁷

3. The Descent of Meanings

During religious experience, the observer experiences the revelation of mysteries and meanings. According to the observer’s capacity, perseverance in spiritual struggle, steadfastness, and moral firmness, the meanings of divine speech descend upon the observer’s inner self. Eventually, they find confirmation, interpretation, and further guidance for their spiritual growth through divine words in every state. A clear explanation of this is provided by Sheikh al-Akbar Muhyiddin Ibn Arabi in his *Futubat al-Makkiyah*:

. . . . العارف المحقق الذي لقيه بعض إخوانه فقال له: يا أخي اذكرني في خلوتك بربك، فأجابته ذلك العبد فقال: إذا ذكرتك فلست معه في خلوة، فمثل ذلك عرف قدر نزولي إلى السماء الدنيا بالليل ولماذا نزلت ولمن طلبت، فأنا أتلو كتابي عليه بلسانه وهو يسمع فتلك مسامرتي وذلك العبد هو الملتذ بكلامي، فإذا وقف مع معانيه فقد خرج عني بفكره وتأمله، فالذي ينبغي له أن يصغي إلي ويخلي سمعه لكلامي حتى أكون أنا في تلك التلاوة كما تلوت عليه وأسمعته أكون أنا الذي أشرح له كلامي وأترجم له عن معناه فتلك مسامرتي معه، فيأخذ العلم مني لا من فكره واعتباره، فلا يبالي بذكر جنة ولا نار، ولا حساب ولا عرض، ولا دنيا ولا آخرة، فإنه ما نظرها بعقله ولا بحث عن الآية بفكره، وإنما ألقى السمع لما أقوله له وهو شهيد حاضر معي أتولى تعليمه بنفسه فأقول له: يا عبدي أردت بهذه الآية كذا وكذا، وهذه الآية الأخرى كذا وكذا، هكذا إلى أن ينصدع الفجر فيحصل من العلوم على يقين ما لم يكن عنده فإنه مني سمع القرآن، ومني سمع شرحه وتفسير معانيه.⁸

The realized knower, whom some of his brothers met and said to him: ‘O my brother, remember me in your solitude with your Lord.’ The servant answered him: ‘If I remember you, then I am no longer in solitude with Him.’ Similarly, only the realized knower understands the nature of my descent to the lowest heaven during the night, why I descend, and whom I seek. I recite My Book to him through his tongue, and he listens to it. This is my intimate conversation with him. He is the servant who takes delight in My words. If he begins to ponder over the meanings of My words, he becomes distanced from Me through his thought and contemplation. What is necessary for him is to listen attentively to Me and focus entirely on My words so that I become fully present in that recitation, just as I was when I recited it to him and made him hear it. Then I will be the One to explain My words to him and interpret their meanings. This is My nightly conversation with him. He takes knowledge from Me, not from his own thoughts or

reflections. He no longer cares for the mention of paradise or hellfire, nor for the mention of judgment, accountability, this world, or the next. He does not contemplate them with his intellect nor examine the verse through his thought. Instead, he listens attentively to what I say to him, being present and attentive with Me. I personally oversee his learning process and tell him, 'O My servant, this is what I meant by this verse and that by the other.' This continues until dawn breaks, and he gains knowledge with certainty that he never had before. He heard the Qur'an from Me, and he heard its explanation and the interpretation of its meanings from Me.

This passage illustrates how the meanings of divine speech are revealed to the observer during religious experience, not through intellectual contemplation but through direct divine instruction and guidance. The observer becomes a witness to the truths of the Qur'an, gaining knowledge from the Source itself.

4. Suspension of Consciousness

The suspension of consciousness during religious experience occurs due to human limitations or sometimes human shortcomings. However, this suspension of consciousness is temporary. While the observer may unveil truths during this state—truths that do not typically manifest during normal circumstances—the suspension of consciousness is not considered favorable. Scholars have viewed such suspensions of consciousness as spiritual shortcomings, defects, or even signs of illness. For example, in his book on Iqbal's *Lectures*, Professor Muhammad Usman recounts an incident involving Shah Ji at the beginning of the first lecture to explain spiritual states and observations. However, scholars do not consider this to be true religious experience or a model to follow.

A spiritual state in which the observer describes truths or details about unseen realms while their own consciousness is suspended is not reliable. This is why, despite the affirmation of Mansur's claim of "*Ana al-Haqq*" (I am the Truth), many of his ideas were not accepted by Sufi scholars, and even Junayd Baghdadi categorized Mansur as one of the *abl al-junoon* (people of madness).

Sufi scholars have classified the suspension of consciousness or the state of *suker* (intoxication) during religious experience as a form of madness. Allama Iqbal, when discussing Nietzsche's spiritual states, wrote that Nietzsche's spiritual experiences overwhelmed him to the extent that his senses became disturbed, and he could not channel his spiritual states in a way that would allow him to accomplish something positive or significant for

humanity. It was as if the intensity of the melody exceeded the musician's capacity, and the force of the song broke him.⁹

5. Steadfastness and Stability

One of the characteristics of religious experience is the development of steadfastness and stability in the observer. This means that as a result of the spiritual states experienced during observation, the observer becomes protected from outward slips and inward disorder or turmoil. After such an experience, neither the body becomes involved in sin and error, nor does the inner self suffer from any disturbance or affliction, even in the midst of life-threatening situations such as gunfire. The inner stability remains unaffected.¹⁰

This can be described as the firmness and stability of faith, where the individual's moral and spiritual beliefs remain unwavering, and they increasingly turn away from external causes, focusing solely on the Divine. Every person who undergoes a true religious experience becomes firmly connected with the Divine and loses hope in anything other than Him. However, this state is only achieved when the person remains steadfast in this quality and committed to their purpose. In other words, a healthy religious experience is one that reveals the eternal truth of the Divine.¹¹

6. Awareness of Multiple Dimensions of Time

During religious experience, the observer experiences a reality beyond the ordinary confines of time and space. Without gaining awareness and understanding of realms that transcend the usual dimensions of time and space, no true religious experience can occur. The Qur'an's mention of the People of the Cave (*Ashab al-Kahf*) and the detailed account of the Prophet Uzair also point to this concept. Additionally, the Qur'an provides examples of this from the Battle of Badr, where it is mentioned that prior to the battle, the Prophet Muhammad (PBUH) was shown a smaller number of enemies in a dream to prevent the Muslims from becoming discouraged. Similarly, during the battle, the believers were shown a smaller number of enemy soldiers, and vice versa, leading both armies to engage fully. The results unfolded as Allah willed. This account is detailed in Surah Al-Anfal, verses 39 and 40. This demonstrates that the perception of different possibilities and realities in the same time and place is a characteristic of religious experience.

7. Communication of Spiritual Experience

Spiritual experiences cannot be regarded as entirely incommunicable. In the history of Islamic mysticism, not only have the religious experiences of Sufis been communicated, but they have also been used as evidence to support various concepts. For example, Allama Iqbal in his *Lectures* referred to Mansur's proclamation of *Ana al-Haqq* (I am the Truth) as an argument for the validity of spiritual experience.¹²

Even if religious experience is considered incommunicable, this applies only to the nature of its occurrence, as the observation is an inner quality and its expression is a form of articulation. When language, becoming attuned to the inner self, converts the experience into words, it is a claim of observation, not the actual observation itself. Since the nature of the experience transcends reason, language cannot fully encapsulate it. Any time language expresses such experiences, it is only a symbolic representation. In essence, religious experience is a state where the heart is present, and language is limited. Thus, the expression of religious experience is often conveyed through silence and the influence of the observer's state rather than through spoken words.¹³

Authenticity of Religious experience

The authenticity and reliability of all spiritual feelings, experiences, and states are contingent upon their external outcomes and effects. The foundation of religious experience or religious experience is moral, because it is through moral maturity and steadfastness that a person can become part of the divine plan for society. Every individual, as an ego, reflects the Absolute Ego, and becoming part of this divine social plan is the first step. Once a person proves their worth according to the standards of higher moral values, only then can they become a participant in the divine social plan. For a person, as a microcosm in this universe, to play a significant role in the macrocosmic universe, the foundation is God's pleasure, capability, understanding, and, in Sufi terminology, "determination" (*himma*).¹⁴

Allama Iqbal writes that, according to the Qur'an, the primary purpose of observing nature is to awaken in humans an awareness of reality, for which nature has been designated as a sign. In light of Surah Ar-Rum, verse 22 ("Indeed, in that are signs for those of knowledge"), nature is a sign for all worlds, for all realms, or for all people of knowledge to reach the truth. The Qur'an's empirical approach instilled in Muslims a respect for reality and the understanding that mere concepts, unless they correspond to and

align with external realities, hold no significance. This, ultimately, led Muslims to become pioneers of modern science. The historical importance of this aspect of Islamic civilization and the Qur'an should not be overlooked—that Islam fostered a spirit of experimentation and the need to observe external outcomes in a time when, in the search for God, visible phenomena were disregarded as insignificant.

According to the Qur'an, the universe has a purpose, and its ever-changing realities compel us to adapt to new forms. Our intellectual efforts overcome the challenges of this path, enabling us to understand the subtle and delicate aspects of human observation. This Qur'anic emphasis on the relationship between truth and its manifestation in the external world should not be ignored, for truth reveals itself through observable phenomena.¹⁵

When the movement of time intensifies, it is through the relationship with objects that awareness and insight about the existence beyond time are developed. In other words, humans cannot, in any form, disregard the tangible. This is why the Qur'an repeatedly emphasizes the reality of change and tells us that if we want to build a lasting civilization, it is essential to understand and master change. Allama Iqbal explains that the ancient civilizations of the world failed because they considered reality to be solely internal and did not acknowledge its necessary connection with the external world. They viewed reality as something that moved from the internal to the external. By doing so, they arrived at a concept that lacked power, and no sustainable civilization can be founded on a powerless concept.¹⁶

Through these details—such as the connection between the internal and external as described in the verses of the Qur'an, the attitudes of past civilizations, and the analysis of their survival or decline—Allama Iqbal demonstrates the truth that any spiritual experience can only be considered authentic if it produces external results and if its outcomes align with observable external phenomena.

While discussing religious experience with a Westernized mindset, Allama Iqbal used Sufi experience as a foundation to establish the authenticity of prophetic experience, i. e., *wahy* (revelation). Although prophetic and Sufi experiences cannot be identical, Iqbal still adopted an approach to create a connection between the two in order to foster acceptance. He wrote that Sufi states are more feelings than thoughts. Thus, both prophets and

Sufis communicate the content of their spiritual and intuitive insights in the form of statements to others. However, they cannot fully convey all the contents of their spiritual and intuitive understanding to their audience.¹⁷

To support his point, Allama Iqbal referenced a verse from the Qur'an, which, according to him, explains the psychology behind spiritual and intuitive experiences rather than their content. The translation of the verse is:

It is not for any human being that Allah should speak to him directly, except through revelation or from behind a veil, or by sending a messenger (an angel) to reveal by His permission what He wills. Indeed, He is Most High and Wise. (Ash-Shura, 42:51)

However, we observe that this verse speaks about how spiritual experience occurs and the process by which it takes place, rather than addressing the psychology behind spiritual experiences. The verse clearly indicates that the initiation of spiritual or intuitive awareness in matters of faith or connection with Allah does not originate from the servant but from Allah. Moreover, this verse applies exclusively to prophetic experience and cannot be applied to non-prophetic experiences.

In support of this perspective, Allama Iqbal further references the verses from Surah An-Najm. These verses provide a detailed account of how the Prophet Muhammad (PBUH) received, absorbed, understood, and transmitted revelation in its entirety, integrity, and accuracy. The verse "ما كذب الفواد ما رأى" "The heart did not lie about what it saw" reflects the unique prophetic role, which cannot be applied to a Sufi experience. The verses from Surah An-Najm (1-18) negate the notion that the contents of prophetic experience cannot be transmitted. If such a claim were true, it would contradict the direct meaning of these verses. The verses clearly state that when the Prophet receives the revelation from Allah, his personal desires, individual qualities, or flaws do not influence it, and there are no deficiencies in his ability to understand or transmit it.

Allama Iqbal writes that the primary reason Sufi observations are considered incommunicable is that they are fundamentally based on emotions rather than rational reasoning, meaning they are directly revealed from the source of divine grace without any intellectual process. However, Iqbal also states that he firmly believes there is an element of cognition in Sufi experiences, and this cognitive element is what allows them to be shaped into

knowledge.¹⁸ If this is true, then the initial point that Sufi experiences cannot be communicated is proven wrong.

Iqbal further explains that it is in the nature of emotion to transform into thought, meaning every reality that is directly observed can be articulated as an intellectual analysis. Here, while distinguishing between Sufi observation and intellectual, rational knowledge, Allama Iqbal makes a key point: emotion and thought are both expressions of the unity of internal observation, with the difference that the non-temporal aspect of internal observation is emotion, and its temporal aspect is thought.

When observation transforms into external results and aligns with the external world, it also takes on a temporal, intellectual, and communicable aspect. Additionally, when external realities are regarded as signs of the Divine, as described in the Qur'an, and used as a bridge to reach the Divine essence, this serves as their non-temporal, spiritual, and internal aspect or dimension.

While distinguishing between religious or spiritual experience and intellectual, rational, and scientific matters, Allama Iqbal explains that religion or spirituality is not like physics or chemistry, where facts are uncovered through the principle of cause and effect. Rather, it represents a completely different realm of human experience. In other words, religious experience cannot be equated with a scientific experiment.

Here, Iqbal introduces a new idea, despite previously stating that the contents of religious experience can be examined similarly to scientific and other rational experiments. However, in this distinction, he highlights a fundamental, conscious, and "nuclear" difference between the two types of experiences: intellectual consciousness and religious or spiritual consciousness are fundamentally different in their nature.

Allama Iqbal did not overlook the differences and commonalities between religion and science, clarifying that both initially rely on concrete experience, but the nature and essence of their experiences differ. Religion aims to access a specific kind of truth related to human emotions and experiences. Religious consciousness is neither like sexual feelings nor like intellectual or scientific awareness, as their characters, purposes, and methods are entirely different from one another. It is only religious consciousness that acquaints us with a reality that, in a certain sense, exists beyond the narrow confines of our self.¹⁹ Therefore, despite being different from scientific and other experiences, the

authenticity of religious experience or religious experience lies in the shared point between them—the production of external results.

Allama Iqbal, in his *Javid Nama*, refers to this as the process of seeking confirmation through three witnesses:²⁰

زنده یا مرده یا جاں بلب
از سه شاهد کن شهادت را طلب
شاهد اول شعورِ خویشتن
خویش را دیدن بنورِ خویشتن
شاهد ثانی شعورِ دیگرے
خویش را دیدن بنورِ دیگرے
شاهد ثالث شعورِ ذاتِ حق
خویش را دیدن بنورِ ذاتِ حق
پیش این نورِ اربمانی استوار
حی و قائم چوں خدا خود را شمار
برمقام خود رسیدن زندگی است
ذات را بے پرده دیدن زندگی است
مردِ مومن در نشازد با صفات
مصطفیٰ راضی نشد الا بذات

Alive, dead, or at the brink of death, seek testimony from three witnesses.

The first witness is self-awareness: seeing yourself by the light of your own being.

The second witness is the consciousness of others: seeing yourself through the light of others.

The third witness is the awareness of the Divine: seeing yourself through the light of the Divine.

If you stand firm in the light of God, consider yourself alive and enduring by God Himself.

Reaching your true position is life, and seeing the Divine essence without veils is life.

The true believer is not satisfied with attributes alone; the Prophet Muhammad (PBUH) was content only with the vision of the Divine essence.

In this passage, Iqbal illustrates that in order to verify one's spiritual experience, one must rely on three stages of awareness: self-awareness, awareness through others, and finally, awareness through the Divine. Life's true meaning is realized when one reaches their rightful place and witnesses the Divine essence without any veils. The true believer, like Prophet Muhammad (PBUH), is not content with merely knowing God's attributes but is satisfied only with the direct vision of the Divine.

Notes and References

-
- ¹ *Kashf-ul-Mahjoob*, p. 336.
 - ² In order to achieve this intimacy thought must rise higher than itself, and find its fulfilment in an attitude of mind which religion describes as prayer. *Reconstruction*, p. 49
 - ³ *Kashf-ul-Mahjoob*, p. 337, 342.
 - ⁴ *Ibid.*, p. 430.
 - ⁵ *Ibid.*, p. 433.
 - ⁶ *Ibid.*, p. 254.
 - ⁷ *Ibid.*, p. 255, 256.
 - ⁸ Ibn-'Arabi, *Futubat-i-Makkiyah*, Chapter 41, vol. 1, p. 305.
 - ⁹ *Kulliyat-i-Iqbal* (Persian), p. 741.
 - ¹⁰ *Reconstruction*, p. 88
 - ¹¹ *Kashf-ul-Mahjoob*, p. 71.
 - ¹² The development of this experience in the religious life of Islam reached its culmination in the well-known words of Hallaj - 'I am the creative truth. ', *Reconstruction*, p. 77
 - ¹³ *Kashf-ul-Mahjoob*, p. 433.
 - ¹⁴ *Futubat-i-Makkiyah*, Chapter 42, vol. 1, p. 306.
 - ¹⁵ *Reconstruction*, pp. 11-12.
 - ¹⁶ This procedure gave them theory without power, and on mere theory no durable civilization can be based. *Reconstruction*, p. 12
 - ¹⁷ *Reconstruction*, pp. 16-17.
 - ¹⁸ Religious experience, I have tried to maintain, is essentially a state of feeling with a cognitive aspect *Reconstruction*, p. 21
 - ¹⁹ *Reconstruction*, pp. 20-21.
 - ²⁰ *Kulliyat-i-Iqbal* (Persian), p. 607.